

INTERDISCIPLINARY APPLICATIONS OF SOCIAL SCIENCE WITHIN  
INTELLIGENCE AND SECURITY:  
AN EXPLORATION OF IMPACTS MADE WITHIN DOMAINS BOTH FOREIGN  
AND DOMESTIC

by  
Charles Hollenbeck

A thesis submitted to Johns Hopkins University in conformity with the requirements for  
the degree of Master of Arts

Baltimore, Maryland  
August 2020

© 2020 Charles Hollenbeck  
All rights reserved

## **ABSTRACT**

Many fields are enriched and empowered by being interdisciplinary in nature. Rather than existing in a solitary state, as individualized islands of expertise, an interdisciplinary approach ensures that there is a greater breadth of knowledge, outside perspectives and vantage points can be utilized, and authority figures within other fields can lend their expertise and experience. This approach can be applied to the intelligence process, which, for both foreign and domestic applications, can combine behavioral studies, cultural studies, psychology, and sociology. The combination of fields showcases a blend between art, science, and practice. Rather than relying upon stereotypical conceptions of law enforcement and intelligence, this thesis explores the activities, training, and education that underlies their operations.

The theoretical framework of this thesis is grounded in the partnership between security studies and social science. While the partnership is transactional, and there is much to be gleaned by social scientists by applying their fields of study to domestic intelligence, the primary focus is on the benefits and positive impacts to professions and disciplines within domestic intelligence and federal law enforcement. In addition to disciplines related to security, a wide array of social sciences are involved to create an interdisciplinary investigation of the research questions posed in each of the three chapters. To answer these questions, research into the impact of social science on intelligence will involve analyzing texts such as peer-reviewed journal articles, news articles, official documents from within the FBI, ATF, CIA, and related textual publications.

In intelligence settings, social science has been used to aid the United States military and intelligence community in both the Wars in Iraq and Afghanistan. On the topic of federal law enforcement and domestic intelligence, attitudes changed regarding social science after the September 11<sup>th</sup>, 2001 terrorist attacks on the Pentagon and World Trade Center. On a local and state level, as well as with specialized branches of federal police intelligence, additional applications of social science exist. Examples found within cultural studies illuminate how social science can be a tool with which to improve police intelligence and law enforcement efforts.

**Primary Reader:** Dr. Kathy Hill

**Advisor:** Dr. Dorothea Wolfson

## CONTENTS

Abstract.....	ii
Introduction.....	1
Chapter 1.....	11
I. Introduction.....	11
II. Research Questions.....	11
III. Literature Review.....	12
The Human Terrain System, Human Geography, and Cultural Intelligence .....	14
Applications of Social Science in Wartime.....	18
Forecasting Future Impacts of Social Science.....	22
IV. Case Studies.....	23
Africa.....	23
Afghanistan.....	26
Iraq.....	30
V. Conclusion.....	33
Chapter 2.....	35
I. Introduction.....	35
II. Research Question.....	36
III. Literature Review.....	36
IV. Theoretical Framework, Methodology, and Limitations.....	43
V. Results.....	45
VI. Discussion of Results.....	56

VII. Conclusion.....	58
Chapter 3.....	60
I. Introduction.....	60
II. Research Questions.....	61
III. Theoretical Framework, Methods, and Considerations.....	61
IV. Literature Review.....	62
Local Law Enforcement and Intelligence.....	62
State Law Enforcement and Intelligence.....	68
Specialized Federal Law Enforcement and Intelligence.....	72
V. Discussion of Findings.....	75
VI. Conclusion.....	79
Conclusion.....	82
Bibliography.....	90
Vita.....	98

## **Introduction**

Many fields find themselves enriched and empowered due to being interdisciplinary in nature. While this is not the case for all fields, some fields are interdisciplinary on a fundamental level. Rather than existing in a solitary state, as individualized islands of expertise, an interdisciplinary approach ensures that there is a greater breadth of knowledge, outside perspectives and vantage points can be utilized, and authority figures within other fields can lend their expertise and experience. In the fields of veterinary sciences, forestry, and biochemistry, for example, multiple educational backgrounds and disciplines are combined. Veterinary sciences often involve pharmacology for pets, biological studies, and the effects of chemicals. Biochemistry combines human biology, virology, cellular biology, and more, with the effects of chemicals on those aforementioned systems. The same can be said for the intelligence process, which, for both foreign and domestic applications, can combine behavioral studies, cultural studies, psychology, sociology, and other disciplines comprising the social sciences. Overall, the combination of fields showcases a blend between art, science, and practice. Always contributory and supplementary, rather than being detrimental or problematic, the social sciences enrich the intelligence process, as well as foreign and domestic security, ranging from the Central Intelligence Agency to community policing efforts in Ferguson, Missouri. Intelligence, or the gathering and processing of information for tactical and strategic purposes is widely varying in its applications. It involves human intelligence (HUMINT), communications intelligence (COMINT), among many more specializations, as well as federal, state, and local law enforcement entities and agencies. In addition, it involves police intelligence efforts led

by the Secret Service, the Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF), and the Drug Enforcement Agency (DEA). Social science ensures a better insight into cultures, solving crimes, locating targets and illegal shipments, as well as achieving a higher level of control, faster and easier than before the involvement of social science. As a result, rather than relying upon stereotypical conceptions of law enforcement and intelligence, this thesis explores the activities, training, and education that underlies their operations.

In intelligence settings, social science has been used to aid the United States military and intelligence community in both the Wars in Iraq and Afghanistan. These measures include Human Terrain Teams (HTTs), and the Human Terrain System (HTS).<sup>1</sup> The concept of Human Geography, as if cultural intelligence maps out entire areas by culture and subculture, has also been used to provide a clarifying perspective of select warzones.<sup>2</sup> Some experts would go as far as to say that social science is of critical importance on the battlefield due to its usefulness.<sup>3</sup> The amount of resources, research, and findings has grown by leaps and bounds, and at an exponential level.<sup>4</sup> Additionally, tribes within Afghanistan, especially those found within remote areas, have been easier with which to communicate due to the prioritization of cultural studies. Within Iraq, due to economic concerns, the behaviors and activities of former Ba’athist party members are better understood due to their seeking of financial stability and rewards, across different

---

<sup>1</sup> Bachmann, Jan. “Kick Down the Door, Clean up the Mess, and Rebuild the House’ – The Africa Command and Transformation of the US Military.” *Geopolitics* 15 (2010): 577. Web.

<sup>2</sup> Bojor, Lavinia. “Human Terrain Team – Premise for Civil-Military Cooperation in Irregular Conflicts.” *Military Art and Science* 3, no. 71 (2013): 227.

<sup>3</sup> Zamri, Zahid. “Social Science Goes to War: The Human Terrain System in Iraq and Afghanistan.” *Intellectual Discourse* 25, no. 1 (2017): 282.

<sup>4</sup> Wainwright, Joel. “The US Military and Human Geography: Reflections on Our Conjecture.” *Annals of the American Association of Geographers* 106, no. 3 (2016): 513.

classes of their ranks. Within these two battlefield settings, the use of social science has been irreplaceably contributory.

There is a robust amount of social science literature, an elaborate training doctrine, and well-developed quantitative and qualitative research programs within the intelligence community.<sup>5</sup> Many people are unaware of their cognitive tendencies, and metacognition is something of a rarity for people who are not trained in the field.<sup>6</sup> In the intelligence analysis process, this is addressed to ensure that agents avoid biases, complexes, and fallacies. Other areas of expertise taken into account are sociocultural intelligence issues, which is supported by administrative figures within the military hierarchy of the United States.<sup>7</sup> One such figure who supports these approaches is General McMaster, who has stated that many problems are not “bullet-izable.”<sup>8</sup> Believing that all issues of security can be solved by force alone is naïve, and the military intelligence and civilian intelligence communities are seeking to rectify that misconception.

Initial efforts to integrate social science into the military and foreign intelligence find their beginnings in the 1960s. According to Ben Connable, an expert within the field of historicizing these efforts, changes begin to be made during the Vietnam War.<sup>9</sup> The

---

<sup>5</sup> Johnston, Rob. *Analytic Culture in the U.S. Intelligence Community: An Ethnographic Study*. Washington, DC: Central Intelligence Agency Center for the Study of Intelligence, 2005. xvii.

<sup>6</sup> Heuer, Richards. *Psychology of Intelligence Analysis*. Washington, DC: Central Intelligence Agency Center for the Study of Intelligence, 1999. 1.

<sup>7</sup> Tones, Robert. “Toward a Smarter Military: Socio-Cultural Intelligence and National Security.” *Parameters* 42, no. 2 (2015): 61.

<sup>8</sup> Collins, Riley. “At the Edges of the Map: The Chronotope of Informatics and Maps of Human Terrain.” *Journal of Military & Strategic Studies* 17, no. 1 (2016): 34.

<sup>9</sup> Connable, Ben. “Human Terrain System is Dead, Long Live ... What? Building and Sustaining Military Cultural Competence in the Aftermath of the Human Terrain System.” *Military Review* 91, no. 1 (2018): 25.



initial promise behind integrating social science into military and intelligence affairs was to reduce the level of “friction” within select populations, which would then reduce casualties.<sup>10</sup> As a result, this prototypical approach worked, and these initial efforts sowed the seeds for what would later become an expansive integration of social science into the intelligence community and armed forces. Furthermore, in some areas, tribal diversity is difficult to manage.<sup>11</sup> Subcultures make situations difficult and complicated, but tribes are an almost miniscule, minute version of subcultures that can still have their own distinct beliefs, preferences, prejudices, and alignments. As a result, cultural studies and sociology can be used in order to gain insight into a highly complex landscape of beliefs, sensibilities, and behaviors. In addition, the same approaches were applied to AFRICOM, which uses anthropology, and related disciplines, to better understand warzones in Africa.<sup>12</sup> In order to make a difference, cultural understanding is argued to be key.<sup>12</sup> Through social science, there can be a lasting impact, and real relationships forged with different populations. By keeping the teams tasked with these efforts small, and more intimate, they can know their target areas to a deeper extent.<sup>13</sup> In contrast to the initial efforts witnessed in Vietnam, additional approaches have expanded the use of social science to the extent that it involves the world over, including Central Asia and Africa.

On the topic of federal law enforcement and domestic intelligence, attitudes changed regarding social science after the September 11<sup>th</sup>, 2001 terrorist attacks on the

---

<sup>10</sup> Lamb, Christopher, et al. “The Way Ahead for Human Terrain Teams.” *National Defense University* 70, no. 3 (2013): 26.

<sup>11</sup> Baczko, Adam. “Legal Rule and Tribal Politics: The US Army and the Taliban in Afghanistan (2001-2013).” *Development and Change* 47, no 6 (2016): 1412.

<sup>12</sup> Bachmann, Jan. “Kick Down the Door, Clean up the Mess, and Rebuild the House’ – The Africa Command and Transformation of the US Military.” *Geopolitics* 15 (2010): 577. Web.

<sup>13</sup> Price, Brian. “Human Terrain at the Crossroads.” *JFQ* 87.4 (2017): 71. Web.

Pentagon and World Trade Center. Federal law enforcement and domestic intelligence agencies began establishing patterns and other behavioral profiles as being paramount, heightening the importance of behavioral and cultural studies.<sup>14</sup> There has also been the creation of deviance narratives.<sup>15</sup> Additionally, there has been the establishment of predictive analysis, as well as attempting to identify potential future criminals.<sup>15</sup> This attempt at prediction involves “criminally oriented communications.”<sup>16</sup> This also pertains so-called “trigger warnings,” or conditions that may place suspects, and people involved in interrogations, to engage in unpredictable and potentially dangerous behavior.<sup>17</sup> Spotting potential criminals that are specifically abusive is also key.<sup>18</sup> All of these practices and approaches involve related security issues, by which the use of social science can be improved and strengthened. A notable development is that the use of social science in domestic settings involves school shootings.<sup>19</sup> Domestic terrorism, political and religious extremists, and more related to these misbehaviors are also included in the aforementioned points of study. Lastly, there is a specific practice used within domestic intelligence called “threat assessment,” and this professional focus involves many fields, spanning from behavioral studies to cultural studies, and to psychology.<sup>20</sup> After the terrorist attacks on New York City and Washington, DC, the

---

<sup>14</sup> Cunningham, David. “The Patterning of Repression: FBI Counterintelligence and the New Left.” *Social Forces* 82.1 (2003): 209. Web.

<sup>15</sup> Cunningham, David, and Barb Browning. “The Emergence of Worthy Targets: Official Frames and Deviance Narratives within the FBI.” *Sociological Forum* 19.3 (2004): 347. Web.

<sup>16</sup> Fitzgerald, James. “The FBI’s Communicated Threat Assessment Database.” *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin* 78.2 (2007): 6. Web.

<sup>17</sup> Follman, Mark. “Trigger Warnings.” *Mother Jones* 40.6 (2015): 22. Web.

<sup>18</sup> Krause, Meredith. “History and Evolution of the FBI’s Undercover Safeguard Program.” *Consulting Psychology Journal: Practice and Research* 61.1 (2009): 5. Web.

<sup>19</sup> “School Shooters Can Be Stopped: A Valuable New Resource.” *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin* (2019): 22. Web.

<sup>20</sup> Tierney, Michael. “Using Behavioral Analysis to Prevent Violent Extremism: Assessing the Cases of Michael Zehaf-Bibeau and Aaron Driver.” *Journal of Threat Assessment and Management* 4.2 (2017): 98. Web.

commitment to social science within domestic intelligence and federal law enforcement has been widely increased.

Within the U.S. Marshals and Department of Homeland Security (DHS), they have followed suit in making changes similar to those found within the FBI. In 2008, U.S. Marshals developed their own behavioral sciences unit, modeled partly after the FBI's own unit that had been established decades earlier.<sup>21</sup> Their goal was to prioritize the use of sociology.<sup>22</sup> In another department, the DHS, they created their own social science unit in 2003, the Human Factors and Behavioral Sciences Division (HFD).<sup>23</sup> It appears as if, across several domestic intelligence agencies, the value of social sciences is recognized and sought after. Personalized and customized. If conditions are met, increasing likelihoods of criminal misbehavior and extremism may be a result.<sup>24</sup> The FBI was the pioneering entity in these developments, preceding their professional counterparts by decades.

Within the FBI, groundbreaking uses of social science were used in application to domestic intelligence settings and to aid federal law enforcement. The more extraordinarily violent crimes are studied, the more they can be understood.<sup>25</sup> Behavioral Analysis Unit 2, or BAU-2, is the FBI's quintessential department for handling matters of this sort. These levels of cognitive and behavioral defects may be unpleasant, but they

---

<sup>21</sup> "Acting Director of the U.S. Marshals Service: Who is David Harlow?" *AllGov*. 20 Feb. 2017. Web. 15 Oct. 2019.

<sup>22</sup> "Qualifications." *U.S. Marshals Service*. N.d. Web. 15 Oct. 2019.

<sup>23</sup> "Science & Technology Directorate Human Factors/Behavioral Sciences Division." *Department of Homeland Security*. 31 Jan. 2011. Web. 15 Oct. 2019.

<sup>24</sup> "Radical Research: Understanding Origins of Terrorism." *Department of Homeland Security*. 6 Jul. 2009. Web. 12 Oct. 2019.

<sup>25</sup> Halpern, Mollie and Mark A. Hilts. "Behavioral Analysts." *Federal Bureau of Investigation*. 2 May 2011. Web. 12 Oct. 2019.

need to be met directly so that they can be prevented.<sup>25</sup> The same type of study can also help when it comes to not only perpetrators, but victims, as well.<sup>25</sup> Moreover, the FBI is also paramount in this field of study, because it lends its expertise and resources to help other law enforcement entities, whether that means federal, state, or local.<sup>25</sup> As a major support, psychology is a major factor for the employment process.<sup>26</sup> In addition to this being found in reality, it is found in fictional settings, such as *The Silence of the Lambs* and Netflix's *Mindhunter* series.<sup>27</sup> The FBI may be the most significant contributor to the use of social science in fields of intelligence, security, and law enforcement.

On a local and state level, as well as with specialized branches of federal police intelligence, additional applications of social science exist. Some branches prioritize studying crime for police intelligence as not individual psychological issues, but involving classifications of people of color.<sup>28</sup> Similar to matters in Afghanistan and Iraq, socioeconomic factors are taken into account.<sup>28</sup> In a major news event, this involves the death of Freddie Gray in Baltimore, Maryland. The culture of police officers themselves is a good point of study, and it helps ensure that it can be changed.<sup>29</sup> An additionally popular point of study is the death of Michael Brown, from Ferguson, Missouri. In fighting traditional police culture, and the warrior mentality, some problematic misbehaviors pertaining to law enforcement and police intelligence can be dissected and

---

<sup>25</sup> Halpern, Mollie and Mark A. Hilts. "Behavioral Analysts." *Federal Bureau of Investigation*. 2 May 2011. Web. 12 Oct. 2019.

<sup>26</sup> O'Toole, Mary Ellen. "Becoming an FBI Profiler." *Mary Ellen O'Toole*. 13 Oct. 2011. Web. 5 Nov. 2019.

<sup>27</sup> Bonn, Scott A. "Criminal Profiling: The Original Mind Hunters." *Psychology Today*. 4 Dec. 2017. Web. 6 Nov. 2019.

<sup>28</sup> Buoziis, Michael. "'Bizarre Dissonances in Baltimore': Class and Race in the Color-blind Discourses of Police Violence." *Democratic Communiqué* 27 (2018): 41. Web.

<sup>29</sup> Robinson, Laurie. "Five Years after Ferguson: Reflecting on Police Reform and What's Ahead." *The Annals of The American Academy of Political and Social Science* (2020): 2. Web.

analyzed.<sup>29</sup> This involves stress levels, and how it affects front-line police officers and police intelligence employees, as well as administrative officials.<sup>30</sup> Using social science is a gateway to better understanding the culture behind policing, as well as the psychological issues, cultural awareness, and sociological factors surrounding their field.

Community policing and its effect on solving crime is significant, but it is important to understand that it does not primarily prevent crime.<sup>31</sup> In areas that utilize community policing, and put cultural studies to use, reported crime still rises. Although crimes are solved faster, they are not outright prevented from occurring.<sup>32</sup> Cultural diversity, cultural awareness, and establishing relationships all contribute to the solving of crimes, establishing a sense of congruency with the community, and locating suspects for the purpose of police intelligence. These factors all encourage cooperation and compliance, hence the higher rates of reporting and solving crimes.<sup>33</sup> Social science encourages better police-civilian interaction that is built on progress and help, so there is a trust there.<sup>34</sup> In addition, these findings are reinforced by the study of police legitimacy, and the psychology of consent and compliance.<sup>35</sup> This involves complying with, and recognizing the authority of, police. There are many contributing factors that inhibit

---

<sup>29</sup> Robinson, Laurie. "Five Years after Ferguson: Reflecting on Police Reform and What's Ahead." *The Annals of The American Academy of Political and Social Science* (2020): 2. Web.

<sup>30</sup> Kirkcaldy, Bruce, et al. "Occupational Stress Profiles of Senior Police Managers: Cross-Cultural Study of Officers From Berlin and Northern Ireland." *Stress Medicine* 10 (1994): 127. Web.

<sup>31</sup> Weisburd, David and Charlotte Gill. "Rethinking the Conclusion that Community Policing Does Not Reduce Crime: Experimental Evidence of Crime Reporting Inflation." *Translational Criminology* (2020): 4. Web.

<sup>32</sup> Ibid., 5.

<sup>33</sup> Beck, Max Mendez and Rivke Jaffe. "Community Policing Goes South: Policy Mobilities and New Geographies of Criminology Theory." *Centre for Crime and Justice Studies* 59 (2019): 827. Web.

<sup>34</sup> Giebels, Ellan, et al. "The Cultural Dimension of Uncertainty Avoidance Impacts Police-Civilian Interaction." *American Psychological Association* 41.1 (2017): 93. Web.

<sup>35</sup> Sommers, Roseanna, and Vanessa Bohns. *The Voluntariness of Voluntary Consent: Consent Searches and the Psychology of Compliance*. New Haven, CT: The Yale Law Journal, 2019. 1962. Web.

police intelligence efforts, and social science seeks to reduce them in an effort to make areas safer and less likely to experience violence as a result of crime.

Additional specialized federal law enforcement agencies use social science for their intelligence efforts. The Secret Service has approaches to find and recruit people with social science and humanities degrees.<sup>36</sup> In their listings, they have a particular focus on sociology.<sup>37</sup> Their publicly stated focus on public policy, business, government, social work, psychology, which defies typical stereotypes involving the secret service.<sup>37</sup> Additionally, there is the ATF. This brand of police intelligence showcases a focus on diversity and cultural awareness.<sup>38</sup> Other listing stress the importance of an educational background in human resources.<sup>39</sup> Acknowledging differing cultures existing in a melting pot, including diversity studies and cultural appreciation, are prioritized in others, creating an atmosphere of interdisciplinarity.<sup>40</sup> Similar to the Secret Service, they stress the importance of criminal justice, sociology, psychology, political science, and other disciplines not often paired with violence, explosives, gun crimes and trafficking and more.<sup>41</sup> There is a pattern of usefulness found within the social sciences. Lastly, there are the focuses of the DEA. The Drug Enforcement Agency uses psychological assessments for their benefit, similar to military intelligence, the CIA, and other agencies tasked with intelligence abroad.<sup>42</sup> Teams are created that will often contain a psychologist, just to

---

<sup>36</sup> “Committed to Developing our Greatest Assets.” *United States Secret Service*. N.d. Web. 28 Jun. 2020.

<sup>37</sup> “What Can I Do with My Sociology Major?” *Georgetown University*. N.d. Web. 28 Jun. 2020.

<sup>38</sup> “Diversity and Inclusion: Why Diversity Matters.” *Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF)*. 17 Apr. 2020. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.

<sup>39</sup> “A Family Legacy of Championing Diversity.” *Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF)*. 28 Feb. 2020. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.

<sup>40</sup> “Erica.” *Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF)*. 25 Jun. 2020. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.

<sup>41</sup> “Special Agent Information Packet.” *U.S. Department of Justice Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives*. N.d. Web. 20 Jun. 2020.

<sup>42</sup> “How to become a Special Agent.” *Drug Enforcement Agency*. N.d. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.

ensure that agents are thinking rationally, are of a sound mind, and are avoiding common psychological issues.<sup>43</sup> In comparison to the ATF and Secret Service, the DEA is still growing, but the foundation has been set. Similar to the uses of social science found within civilian and foreign intelligence, as well as domestic intelligence and federal law enforcement, police intelligence agencies operating within the United States have also taken the initiative to make social science both integral and irreplaceable among their ranks.

---

<sup>43</sup> Sannerud, Christine. "Federal Drug Science Specialist." *American Psychological Organization*. 1996. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.

## **Chapter 1: The Impact of Social Science in Military and Intelligence Settings:**

### **Africa, Afghanistan, and Iraq**

#### **I: Introduction**

The social sciences are a broadly defined field, comprised of disciplines ranging from psychology to cultural studies, and from sociology to behavioral norms. Due to their applicability on the battlefield, in civilian intelligence, and in military operations, their usefulness has grown exponentially as social science's strategic value has become evident. Intelligence agencies and military divisions have used the social sciences to an increasing frequency and amplitude in recent decades. They are found in many spaces and corners within civilian and military intelligence, and have received a steadily increasing level of funding and attention. The Wars in Iraq and Afghanistan, as well as conflicts in Africa, highlight the beneficial impact of social science on military and intelligence endeavors. Operations include working with tribes in order to maintain local favor, studying the complexities of social, cultural, and behavioral norms, and analyzing the complicated landscape of subcultures found abroad. Civilian intelligence and the military have both experienced beneficial and positive impacts from the utilization of the social sciences.

#### **II: Research Questions**

What is the impact of the expanded capacities of the social sciences on intelligence? What are the emergent applications of the social sciences in intelligence? How are existing tasks improved, in terms of effectiveness, by the involvement of the social sciences?



### III: Literature Review

There are multiple theories in competition of how best to improve the broader intelligence community. One prevailing approach, according to the Committee on Behavioral and Social Science Research to Improve Intelligence Analysis for National Security's report, entitled *Intelligence Analysis for Tomorrow: Advances from the Behavioral and Social Sciences*, is to combat cultural and social issues. The report states that “two starting elements would be important steps toward enhancing skills and overcoming organizational and cultural barriers to collaboration.”<sup>44</sup> The report also adds the idea, “one way to enhance collaboration in the IC may be to increase its differentiation and specialization.”<sup>45</sup> Wholesale approaches to addressing subtleties regarding culture, ethnicities, and social customs are not as useful in comparison to adopting a sense of specificity.

Social science has been used in war zones abroad, but it is also being applied to the intelligence community in a domestic capacity. In Richard Heuer's *Psychology of Intelligence Analysis*, he addresses how social science is impacting the intelligence process within the United States. He writes, “A basic finding of cognitive psychology is that people have no conscious experience of most of what happens in the human mind.”<sup>46</sup> In other words, the lack of familiarity with cognition and metacognition, among other focuses within cognitive psychology, on behalf of intelligence community employees detrimental affects the entire discipline. Additionally, “Weaknesses and biases inherent in

---

<sup>44</sup> Committee on Behavioral and Social Science Research to Improve Intelligence Analysis for National Security. *Intelligence Analysis for Tomorrow: Advances from the Behavioral and Social Sciences*. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press, 2011. 52.

<sup>45</sup> Ibid., 68.

<sup>46</sup> Heuer, Richards. *Psychology of Intelligence Analysis*. Washington, DC: Central Intelligence Agency Center for the Study of Intelligence, 1999. 1.

the human thinking process can be deconstructed through carefully designed experiments.”<sup>46</sup> The social sciences are making civilian and military intelligence more accurate, and more effective.

Returning to the implementation of the social sciences abroad, intensive changes have been made. The journal article *Analytic Culture in the U.S. Intelligence Community: An Ethnographic Study*, written by Rob Johnston, highlights how, “especially in the military,” there is a robust amount of “social science literature, an elaborate training doctrine, and well-developed quantitative and qualitative research programs.”<sup>47</sup> In a comprehensive manner, comprised of both value-based humanities and social sciences, and calculation and statistics-based quantitative disciplines.

Upon acknowledging the importance of the social sciences, the next key step is to create a community within the intelligence community that adopts and respects their fundamental benefits. Susan Straus' article, “The Group Matters: A Review of the Processes and Outcomes in Intelligence Analysis,” written for the *American Psychological Association*, explores the benefits to creating a sense of coherence among intelligence community members. She writes that intelligence analysis fundamentally involves cognitive activities. It consists largely of tasks such as identifying problems, generating and evaluating hypotheses and ideas, identifying and assessing open source and classified information, recognizing patterns in large sets of data, judging the probability of events, aggregating information, and providing results, chiefly in the form

---

<sup>46</sup> Heuer, Richards. *Psychology of Intelligence Analysis*. Washington, DC: Central Intelligence Agency Center for the Study of Intelligence, 1999. 1.

<sup>47</sup> Johnston, Rob. *Analytic Culture in the U.S. Intelligence Community: An Ethnographic Study*. Washington, DC: Central Intelligence Agency Center for the Study of Intelligence, 2005. xvii.

of judgments, forecasts, and insights to policymakers.<sup>48</sup> Whether referring to cultural, behavioral, and social issues abroad, or an application of social skills domestically, the two form a natural pairing. The tasks and challenges faced by the intelligence community are enriched by a workforce competent in the social sciences.

Moving forward, it is important to understand how the social sciences apply to real-world settings. “Toward a Smarter Military: Socio-Cultural Intelligence and National Security,” a journal article by Robert Tomes, showcases the serious consequences of mishandling the social sciences. He explains, “The implications for failing to sustain and improve socio-cultural intelligence capabilities are manifold.”<sup>49</sup> Failed operations have consequences, however the consequences of seriously inhibited or failed conflicts is exponentially worse. For example, “The failure to understand the true nature of Iraqi deception about weapons of mass destruction reinforced biases and misperception, ultimately leading to the invasion of Iraq in 2003.”<sup>49</sup> Local and regional destabilizing can be a consequence, as well as a tremendous waste of funding and human lives.

### **The Human Terrain System, Human Geography, and Cultural Intelligence**

Some of the most effective approaches to the use of the social sciences abroad are the Human Terrain System, Human Geography, and Cultural Intelligence. Lavinia Bojor, who wrote “Human Terrain Team – Premise for Civil-Military Cooperation in Irregular Conflicts,” analyzes how the social sciences and the military are inseparable. He elaborates further, “military forces, prepared in terms of carrying warfare, should be supported by training and deploying specialized teams to enable the cultural adaptation of

---

<sup>48</sup> Straus, Susan, et al. “The Group Matters: A Review of the Processes and Outcomes in Intelligence Analysis.” *American Psychological Association* 15, no. 2 (2011): 128.

<sup>49</sup> Tomes, Robert. “Toward a Smarter Military: Socio-Cultural Intelligence and National Security.” *Parameters* 42, no. 2 (2015): 61.

military detachments in acting.”<sup>50</sup> In addition, Riley Collins' article “At the Edges of the Map: The Chronotope of Informatics and Maps of Human Terrain” reinforces the monumental importance of cultural knowledge. He points out how, according to General McMaster, “some problems in the world are not bullet-izable.”<sup>51</sup> The article points to uses in Afghanistan, and how the cultures of its cities and rural tribal communities responded well to the Human Terrain System.<sup>8</sup> Additionally, the article highlights the Iraq War, and how Human Terrain Teams produced “salient definitions of culture from local populations in conflict zones.”<sup>51</sup> By applying this interdisciplinary social science approach to an active war zone, the United States' civilian and military intelligence forces were able to gain a significant advantage.

There are experts in the field who contest the usefulness of the social sciences in real-world settings. Ben Connable, for example, who is a retired officer in the military, believes that the approaches similar to the Human Terrain System have expired. In “Human Terrain System is Dead, Long Live ... What? Building and Sustaining Military Cultural Competence in the Aftermath of the Human Terrain System,” he argues that the “U.S. military needs to make some fundamental decisions about culture,” having served as a member of the Human Terrain System.”<sup>52</sup> Since he worked in such close proximity to the very department in question, it is important to consider him an authority figure on the topic. While he feels as if the Human Terrain System is rightly gone, he still cautions that cultures should be studied by the United States military, because, “if it fails to take

---

<sup>50</sup> Bojor, Laviniu. “Human Terrain Team – Premise for Civil-Military Cooperation in Irregular Conflicts.” *Military Art and Science* 3, no. 71 (2013): 227.

<sup>51</sup> Collins, Riley. “At the Edges of the Map: The Chronotope of Informatics and Maps of Human Terrain.” *Journal of Military & Strategic Studies* 17, no. 1 (2016): 34.

<sup>52</sup> Connable, Ben. “Human Terrain System is Dead, Long Live ... What? Building and Sustaining Military Cultural Competence in the Aftermath of the Human Terrain System.” *Military Review* 91, no. 1 (2018): 25.

action now, it will—as many experts have argued since at least 2003—see its capabilities fade as they did after the Vietnam War.”<sup>52</sup> Overall, his idea is not so much that the usefulness of social science itself has been diminished beyond relevancy, but rather that select applications should still be in play.

As a whole, social science is beneficial to modern warfare that is both complex and complicated. Omer Dostri writes, “Cultural understanding and knowledge are outcomes of cultural intelligence which are obtained by the Human Terrain System and must be a structural and operational means of each military mission and force,” in his text “The Role of Human Terrain and Cultural Intelligence in Contemporary Hybrid and Urban Warfare.”<sup>53</sup> Modern warfare is complex due to the fact that there are many moving pieces to consider, making for quite a puzzle. It is complicated, however, due to the fact that those many moving intricate pieces pose a considerable level of difficulty. Social science, given its wide breadth of behavioral, social, psychological, and cultural focuses, provides some insight into the newfound puzzle that is modern war zones.

The lasting legacy of the social sciences in application to war zones is controversial in nature, despite its usefulness. One of the key reasons for this continuing legacy is its use, or misuse, in Vietnam. Benjamin Hopkins, in his article, “The long durée of the Human Terrain: Politics, cultural knowledge and the technical fix,” states that cultural studies with military and civilian intelligence is thought, by some, to be “irreparably tainted by the failures of Vietnam.”<sup>54</sup> Even though there have been previous

---

<sup>52</sup> Connable, Ben. “Human Terrain System is Dead, Long Live ... What? Building and Sustaining Military Cultural Competence in the Aftermath of the Human Terrain System.” *Military Review* 91, no. 1 (2018): 25.

<sup>53</sup> Dostri, Omer. “The Role of Human Terrain and Cultural Intelligence in Contemporary Hybrid and Urban Warfare.” *The International Journal of Intelligence Security, and Public Affairs* 21, no. 1 (2019): 84.

<sup>54</sup> Hopkins, Benjamin. “The long durée of the Human Terrain: Politics, cultural knowledge and the technical fix.” *Anthropology Today* 32, no. 3 (2016): 8.

misadventures within the social sciences, there were reasons for those failings, and they mostly appear to be excusable. Overall, in Vietnam, social science was still in its adolescence, and was therefore not a well-rounded science. It has since grown, and since lowered the likelihood of failure in war zone settings.

The future of the social sciences within war zones, either being used by civilian or military intelligence, appears to be promising. An examination of its potential future use is found in Christopher Lamb's article titled "The Way Ahead for Human Terrain Teams." The benefits, if one were to extrapolate, continue into the future without protest. For example, the use of the social sciences contributes to a "reduced friction with the population (which in turn reduced casualties)."<sup>55</sup> When it comes to gathering data and information, Lamb notes how there is "improved information operations by helping tailor message content and style to reach Afghan audiences better."<sup>55</sup> The key benefit to the social sciences is better understanding the population one seeks to occupy and aid. A lasting benefit of using social science, and a projected benefit in the future, is "better 'damage limitation' when untoward events [occur] that had to be explained and compensated for with the Afghan populace."<sup>56</sup> Every culture has its own unique set of values, and the same can be said for subcultures as well. By having a sense of specificity with regards to values, American forces may better appeal to their wants and needs.

Ending on a positive note, Richard Medina, who produced the article "From Anthropology to Human Geography: Human Terrain and the Evolution of Operational Sociocultural Understanding," suggests social science will be a continued endeavor.

---

<sup>55</sup> Lamb, Christopher, et al. "The Way Ahead for Human Terrain Teams." *National Defense University* 70, no. 3 (2013): 26.

<sup>56</sup> *Ibid.*, 27.

Whether in the form of the Human Terrain System, or a related approach, there is a usefulness to be found as military operations proceed forth. Overall, there will seemingly always be a “great need for understanding sociocultural systems and environments on and off the battlefield.”<sup>57</sup> He suggests that the best way of maintaining a robust “sociocultural knowledge base” to maintain and amplify the study of the fields housed within the social science.<sup>57</sup> An unwillingness to do so would be both costly and strategically pointless.

### **Application of Social Science in Wartime**

Specifically regarding wartime, social science has been proven to contribute in many recent engagements. A key engagement is the focus of Adam Baczko's “Legal Rule and Tribal Politics: The US Army and the Taliban in Afghanistan (2001-2013).” In this particular conflict, the “US Army played tribal politics.”<sup>58</sup> Tribes, which are not only subcultural in nature, but provide the highest level of specificity, can be tremendously difficult to study from an intelligence perspective. With the American-led intervention implemented on behalf of the west affecting cities primarily, “where society had been deeply transformed,” the largely socially conservative tribal communities demanded a more unique approach.<sup>58</sup> Social science, with its many tools found in the disciplines of cultural studies, behavior, and social norms, answered the call.

The use of the social sciences is also beneficial for anticipatory engagements, such as with the state of Iran. By using social science's wide breadth of tools and approaches, more detailed profiles can be constructed by American intelligence communities. The Library of Congress' Federal Research Division requested a

---

<sup>57</sup> Medina, Richard. “From Anthropology to Human Geography: Human Terrain and the Evolution of Operational Sociocultural Understanding.” *Intelligence and National Security* 31, no. 2 (2016): 138.

<sup>58</sup> Baczko, Adam. “Legal Rule and Tribal Politics: The US Army and the Taliban in Afghanistan (2001-2013).” *Development and Change* 47, no 6 (2016): 1412.

comprehensive report on Iran, and the text, *Iran's Ministry of Intelligence and Security: A Profile*, was produced. In the final product, it was stated that “The ministry has a Department of Disinformation, which is in charge of creating and waging psychological warfare against the enemies of the Islamic Republic”<sup>59</sup> Without an in-depth understanding of psychology, the potential adversary's disinformation department may not be as deeply understood. This understanding, if an engagement were to occur, would be invaluable in wartime. The report also states, “The largest department within MOIS, the Department of Disinformation (Farsi: *nefaq*), uses psychological warfare and disinformation against the government's opponents.”<sup>60</sup> Psychological warfare and PSYOPs are both housed within the greater field of social science. Experts within that field are necessary for understanding and providing countermeasures against these weapons.

Outside of potential engagements and its usefulness there, social scientists are able to anticipate its usefulness due to its present day usefulness right now. The article written by Anthony King, “Social Science Goes to War: The Human Terrain System in Iran and Afghanistan,” explains how the Human Terrain system and its use of Human Terrain Teams have made the collection of cultural knowledge actionable, and able to be put to use on the battlefield.<sup>61</sup> The Department of Defense has publicly recognized the usefulness of social science, and released a “Joint urgent operational needs statement” that highlights the increase in social science's presence in decision-making, including the

---

<sup>59</sup> *Iran's Ministry of Intelligence and Security: A Profile*. Washington, DC: Library of Congress Federal Research Division, 2012. 1.

<sup>60</sup> *Ibid.*, 31.

<sup>61</sup> King, Anthony. “Social Science Goes to War: The Human Terrain System in Iran and Afghanistan.” Eds. Montgomery McFate and Janice Laurence. *International Affairs* 92, no. 6 (2016): 1525.



strengthening of the Human Terrain System and its Human Terrain Teams.<sup>61</sup> In making these changes, operational effectiveness is enhanced, and socio-cultural knowledge can be preserved for study and shared across civilian and military intelligence agencies.<sup>61</sup> Social scientists and experts of all kinds aid commanders by providing academic analyses of local and regional dynamics.<sup>61</sup>

There are important cultural dynamics to consider when the use of social science is applied to battlefields. Jason Lyall's article "Explaining Support for Combatants during Wartime: A Survey Experiment in Afghanistan" questions "How are civilian attitudes toward combatants affected by wartime victimization?"<sup>62</sup> Since innocent bystanders are always effected in violent battlefields, who hurt them, the motives of the belligerents, and violent experiences with American forces typically come into consideration. A principal question is: "How are civilian attitudes toward combatants affected by wartime victimization?"<sup>62</sup> Lamb continues his question, asking, "Are these effects conditional on which combatant inflicted the harm?"<sup>19</sup> This is yet another wonderfully beneficial application of the social sciences in a battlefield setting. While it is complicated, the study of subcultural intricacies pays off in the form of saving funding, time, and lives.

The specificity and applicability of the social sciences in wartime settings is difficult to quantify, but its effectiveness is found throughout many fields. "Enabling Local Solutions to Global Problems: The Role of Cultural Intelligence in Building Global SOF Networks" addresses the particular nature of American special forces and their endeavors. Emily Spencer writes, "To work effectively in this global environment, SOF

---

<sup>61</sup> King, Anthony. "Social Science Goes to War: The Human Terrain System in Iran and Afghanistan." Eds. Montgomery McFate and Janice Laurence. *International Affairs* 92, no. 6 (2016): 1525.

<sup>62</sup> Lyall, Jason. "Explaining Support for Combatants during Wartime: A Survey Experiment in Afghanistan." *American Political Science Review* 107, no. 4 (2013): 679.

behaves in culturally intelligent manner.”<sup>63</sup> Whether that means appealing to tribal leaders behind enemy lines in an attempt to sway local favor, or gaining valuable insights that might provide an edge in a particular locality, the social sciences have long been used to the benefit of special forces teams. Spencer further explains, “Cultural intelligence—or cross cultural competence or cultural savvy as some have referred to it—refers to the ability to recognize the shared beliefs, values, attitudes and behaviors of a group of people and, most importantly, to apply this knowledge toward a special goal.”<sup>64</sup> Overall, out of the many types of military forces involved in the use of the social sciences, it is arguable that the special forces groups of the United States have experienced many particular benefits of considerable value.

On a final note, some experts allege that social science is not only helpful on the battlefield, but absolutely integral. Zahid Zamri, author of “Social Science Goes to War: The Human Terrain System in Iraq and Afghanistan” believes that the many social sciences are critically important to achieving success in battle. He believes that the “reason for the deployment [of the social sciences] was that the military forces could not win the battle without understanding the social 'terrain' of the locals.”<sup>65</sup> In other words, while it may be a bit exaggerated to say that the social sciences are the keystone for the success of a military operation, their benefit of their integration is undoubted. It is expected that some theorists and experts who have studied and witnessed the benefits of social science in intelligence settings are enamored by its success.

---

<sup>63</sup> Spencer, Emily. “Enabling Local Solutions to Global Problems: The Role of Cultural Intelligence in Building Global SOF Networks.” *Journal of Strategic Security* 7, no. 2 (2014): 30.

<sup>64</sup> *Ibid.*, 31.

<sup>65</sup> Zamri, Zahid. “Social Science Goes to War: The Human Terrain System in Iraq and Afghanistan.” *Intellectual Discourse* 25, no. 1 (2017): 282.

## Forecasting Future Impacts of Social Science

Turning towards the future, social science appears to be a positive force for conflict resolution. In “The US Military and Human Geography: Reflections on Our Conjecture,” by Joel Wainwright, it is explained how, “In recent years, the literature on human geography and the U.S. military has grown enormously.”<sup>66</sup> Where there is value, an effort to expand funding and knowledge bases will follow. Wainwright elaborates by writing, “sources suggest that the immediate inspiration for human terrain analysis came when U.S. military leaders, most notably David Petraeus, concluded that the failure of the United States to win hegemony in Iraq and Afghanistan was on the military's lack of social and cultural understanding.”<sup>67</sup> When a sitting influential commander states that a lack of social and cultural knowledge is key to a failure, subordinates and superiors take note, and adjust accordingly.

Forecasting the future, academics such as Patrick Walsh speculate how the intelligence community will adjust to the newfound, and proven, usefulness of the social sciences. In “Making future leaders in the US intelligence community: challenges and opportunities,” written for the journal *Intelligence and National Security*, he claims that it is important to consider which “factors are important in developing the future leaders of the US intelligence community in the post-9/11 security environment.”<sup>68</sup> Deciding how to proceeding forth is crucial, and may have profound effects that trickle downward to commanders, servicemen, and foreign citizens. He advises that “further work is needed to

---

<sup>66</sup> Wainwright, Joel. “The US Military and Human Geography: Reflections on Our Conjecture.” *Annals of the American Association of Geographers* 106, no. 3 (2016): 513.

<sup>67</sup> Ibid., 514.

<sup>68</sup> Walsh, Patrick. “Making future leaders in the US intelligence community: challenges and opportunities.” *Intelligence and National Security* 32, no. 4 (2017): 441.

explore how authentic leadership impacts upon and in turn is influenced by the organization's culture, structure and the nature of the work it is involved in.”<sup>69</sup> The work with which social scientists are involved, the way in which the civilian and military organizations are run, and the culture they create and foster will be critical to determining its successes and failures.

#### **IV: Case Studies**

##### **Africa**

After being extensively tested in both Afghanistan and Iraq, human terrain teams (HTTs), as part of a larger human terrain system (HTS), were utilized in Africa. “Kick Down the Door, Clean up the Mess, and Rebuild the House’ – The Africa Command and Transformation of the US Military,” by Jan Bachmann, explains how social science is impacting the relatively newfound AFRICOM. Some employees within the Department of Defense find that, in a controversial sense, the use of social science within intelligence and the military would make otherwise obscure disciplines useful. For example, according “to anthropologist and DoD official Montgomery McFate, a symbiotic relationship between the military and anthropology would lead the latter out of its current isolationist (“self-flagellating”, “postmodern”) ivory tower.”<sup>70</sup> In the case of McFate, it appears as if anthropology is suspected as being relegated to a corner of academia that is not practical or viable. Instead, it may be better used in a military or intelligence setting. The use of social sciences has been revitalized in Africa. According to McFate, “anthropologists' 'assistance is urgently needed in times of war,’” and that includes

---

<sup>69</sup> Walsh, Patrick. “Making future leaders in the US intelligence community: challenges and opportunities.” *Intelligence and National Security* 32, no. 4 (2017): 445.

<sup>70</sup> Bachmann, Jan. “Kick Down the Door, Clean up the Mess, and Rebuild the House’ – The Africa Command and Transformation of the US Military.” *Geopolitics* 15 (2010): 577. Web.

strategic endeavors controlled by AFRICOM. Finding its start in Vietnam, and then-labeled “Civil Operations and Revolutionary Development Support,” or CORDS, the HTS has been implemented elsewhere.<sup>71</sup> AFRICOM General William Ward expressed his support of the HTS in Africa, stating, “We need to have a better understanding of those with whom we deal if we are to make a difference that makes sense from their point of view and unless it does, it won't last.”<sup>72</sup> These sorts of changes, which appeal to foreign populations, have a higher likelihood of creating “lasting enchantments” that contribute to a “secure environment.”<sup>72</sup> Overall, in order to be as effective as possible, it is important that different military and intelligence forces “understand one another.”<sup>28</sup> Since the implementation of the HTS in Africa, “AFRICOM has established a social science research centre consisting of up to thirty academic researchers to help AFRICOM know 'how societies tick to make better results.'”<sup>72</sup> The impact of the social sciences on military and intelligence endeavors in Africa has been tremendous, and most open source signs point towards it being beneficial. Commanders value the disciplines found within the social sciences, and significant resources are being allocated to bolster those disciplines.

The impact of the social sciences on military and intelligence operations is sizable enough that it is labeled “transformative.”<sup>73</sup> For the foreseeable future, “Africa is likely to become a testing ground for the US military's expansion into 'non-traditional' activities ranging from counterinsurgency to conflict prevention,” all of which is aided by the use of cultural and social studies.<sup>73</sup> Brian Price, in his article, “Human Terrain at the

---

<sup>71</sup> Bachmann, Jan. “Kick Down the Door, Clean up the Mess, and Rebuild the House’ – The Africa Command and Transformation of the US Military.” *Geopolitics* 15 (2010): 578. Web.

<sup>72</sup> Ibid., 579.

<sup>73</sup> Ibid., 564.

Crossroads,” reinforces the idea that Africa is a testing ground for social science in intelligence, writing, “Even as HTTs were removed from Iraq in 2012, a small team was deployed in support of U.S. Africa Command (USAFRICOM).”<sup>74</sup> According to him, “small cells” were used in order to support “other combatant commands.”<sup>74</sup> For reasons unknown, the United States' military and intelligence commanders decided to keep social science's involvement in foreign affairs limited, either seeing no need for expansion, or being pleased with the existing size of operations. Price explains, “a larger cell was proposed but never funded for U.S. Pacific Command.”<sup>74</sup> Overall, under the advisement of Lieutenant General Michael Flynn and Kerry Patton, the Human Terrain System has been kept “consolidated with other intelligence assets,” and has remained smaller and scattered in nature.<sup>74</sup> Its impact on military and intelligence endeavors is still transformative in nature, with many existing and emergent testing grounds existing around the world.

While no two environments or testing grounds are the same, the positive impacts made in Africa by Human Terrain Teams has ensured their continuation in that theater. In “Anthropology and the Military: AFRICOM, 'culture' and future of Human Terrain Analysis,” by Robert Albrow, written for *Anthropology Today*, the current approach has been accepted by experts in the field of social science. The Executive Board of the American Anthropological Association “accepted a comprehensive assessment of the US Army's Human Terrain System (HTS) 'proof of concept' programme.”<sup>75</sup> The assessment was “conducted over a two-year period by the Association's Ad Hoc Commission on

---

<sup>74</sup> Price, Brian. “Human Terrain at the Crossroads.” *JFQ* 87.4 (2017): 71. Web.

<sup>75</sup> Albrow, Robert. “Anthropology and the Military: AFRICOM, 'culture' and future of Human Terrain Analysis.” *Anthropology Today* 26. 1 (2010): 22. Web.

## Anthropology's Engagement with the Security and Intelligence Communities

(CEAUSSIC).<sup>76</sup> Albro explains that the report was created with “significant attention given to activities of Human Terrain Teams (HTTs) and related implications for the discipline of anthropology.”<sup>76</sup> Despite the “complicated human terrain on the African continent,” promoting and prioritizing the “understanding of tribal and clan composition” has lowered the likelihood of so-called “kinetic engagements.”<sup>77</sup> “Kinetic” engagements is “military parlance for the proactive use of potentially lethal force.”<sup>78</sup> In other words, with the diverse, and oftentimes precarious, social and cultural landscape of Africa in mind, the use of social science had a net positive impact. The likelihood of lethal engagements was lowered, and the use of the social sciences was approved by a panel of experts whose expertise is anthropology.

### **Afghanistan**

In the case of Afghanistan, and the prototypical use of Human Terrain Teams, the net impact appears to be as positive as with Africa. One of the key issues is that, according to Ben Walter, author of “Interpreting the 'Human Terrain' of Afghanistan with Enlightenment Philosophy,” one of the key issues is that policymakers in Afghanistan were reliant upon “political ideas emerging from seventeenth-century Enlightenment philosophy.”<sup>79</sup> Approaches to addressing terrorism and insurgencies later evolved to include the “usage of social science disciplines to produce 'objective' information about

---

<sup>76</sup> Albro, Robert. “Anthropology and the Military: AFRICOM, 'culture' and future of Human Terrain Analysis.” *Anthropology Today* 26. 1 (2010): 31. Web.

<sup>77</sup> Ibid., 32.

<sup>78</sup> Ibid., 24.

<sup>79</sup> Walter, Ben. “Interpreting the 'Human Terrain' of Afghanistan with Enlightenment Philosophy.” *International Studies Perspectives* (2016): 409. Web.

the local societies with which they are engaged.”<sup>80</sup> With this evolution, the qualities and traits of enemy combatants, and complex and complicated social landscapes, was able to be viewed in an objective and truthful manner, rather than one grounded in dated belief systems.

The application of social sciences in military and intelligence settings was successful in Afghanistan, and helped leadership figures in both professions. Walter notes, “the most pronounced expression of 'Human Terrain Systems' involved embedding social scientists within US military units in Iraq and Afghanistan to provide information to military commanders.”<sup>81</sup> With this information, commanders were able to see the world not as they would like for it to be seen, or how they had been trained for it to be seen, but how it was in actuality, through the lens of social science. In a top-down manner, this sense of clarity and objectivity was crucial for ensuring a higher likelihood of tactically and strategically beneficial outcomes for the subordinates under their command. Military commanders, in addition to their formal educations and experiences, are only as effective as the information they receive. In this case, the newfound application of social science in a military capacity proved to be invaluable for making effective and accurate decisions in a war zone.

The use of the terminology “terrain” in “Human Terrain Teams” and “Human Terrain System” has applications that are quite literal and helpful for decision-making. Walter writes, “policymakers and academics turned to social sciences like anthropology and geography as potential resources through which the US military could accurately

---

<sup>80</sup> Walter, Ben. “Interpreting the 'Human Terrain' of Afghanistan with Enlightenment Philosophy.” *International Studies Perspectives* (2016): 410. Web.

<sup>81</sup> Ibid., 411.



map the 'terrain' of local societies and gain insight into their politics and culture.”<sup>82</sup> The terrain in question is both a mapping of actual geographical terrain, and a mapping of neighboring and intersecting cultures and subcultures. The complex and complicated borderlands between cultures and subcultures can be ordinarily difficult to understand, but the use of social scientists eases the pathway towards better understandings. Overall, this newfound ease flows upward, with commanders able to better understand the landscape at hand. The end result is that conflicts in locations such as Afghanistan have been positively impacted by the use of Human Terrain Teams.

In past engagements and conflicts, there is a wide array of tools, techniques, and approaches available to social scientists in military and intelligence capacities. Findings in Afghanistan appear to support the findings and general consensus provided in the overview of experts' stances and positions in the literature review. For example, Walter explains how social science has provided new terminologies and frameworks through which to view the public with which they are engaged.<sup>82</sup> The military and intelligence communities have their own labels, terms, and views of citizens from foreign states, and social science adds to that by providing their own. With the aid of social scientists, new terms such as “'social networks,' 'beliefs,' 'roles and statuses,' 'social norms,' 'culture,' and 'ideologies'” are added to military commanders' and intelligence officials' lexicon.<sup>82</sup> With these terminologies, their own understandings of foreign citizens, cultures, and subcultures has the potential to be understood on an alternative level, which may prove to be strategically useful.

---

<sup>82</sup> Walter, Ben. “Interpreting the 'Human Terrain' of Afghanistan with Enlightenment Philosophy.” *International Studies Perspectives* (2016): 415. Web.

Walter's observations and conclusions are echoed by researcher Michael C. Davies, who works for the National Defense University. In his text, "Soft' Counterinsurgency: Human Terrain Teams and US Military Strategy in Iraq and Afghanistan," there were few issues that diminished the effectiveness of social science in the military. One example is that he stated the Human Terrain System "suffered from internal disquiet," and responded too often, and too publicly, to "numerous denunciations" and "significant press attention."<sup>83</sup> Otherwise, the program "provided soldiers and commanders with quality assessments of the human terrain."<sup>84</sup> Although, unlike Walter's belief that using terms from social science was helpful, Davies cites Paul Joseph, a sociology professor for Tufts University, who states, "No, [they] did not."<sup>84</sup> Rather, an argument from some experts in the field state that the new terms and frameworks from social science did not achieve their "stated objective of altering military perceptions of the battle space."<sup>84</sup> Aside from this criticism, the findings of Davies are close in appearance to those of Walter when specifically focusing on Afghanistan. The War on Terror, with specific regards to the conflict in Afghanistan, showcases the impact of the social sciences on military and intelligence operations. Activities include working with tribespeople in order to gain local favor, understanding the intricacies of behavioral and cultural norms, and psychological and sociological analyses of complex and complicated cultures and subcultures. Civilian, military, and domestic intelligence have all experienced a positive and beneficial impact from the integration and use of the social sciences. Additionally, while the aforementioned tasks and challenges facing social

---

<sup>83</sup> Joseph, Paul. "Soft' Counterinsurgency: Human Terrain Teams and US Military Strategy in Iraq and Afghanistan." Ed. Michael C. Davies. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014. 136. Web.

<sup>84</sup> Ibid., 137.

scientists regarding conflicts in Africa are often different, at least in part, from the challenges social scientists face in Afghanistan and Iraq, focusing on social science for each conflict in which the United States is engaged appears to be universally applicable and helpful in building an intimate familiarity with cultures abroad.

### **Iraq**

As a point of study, one of the most controversial environments for social science is Iraq, as part of a larger War on Terror. Ariel Ahram, associate professor of Arab studies for Virginia Tech, is the author of “Iraq in the Social Sciences: Testing the Limits of Research.” He argues that the “study of Iraq has been critically hampered by the opacity of the regime and the country's inaccessibility for field research, a staple technique for effective social science research.”<sup>85</sup> This means that, according to his findings, the use of social science was not as effective as it could have been, given the nature of its national politics, and the fact that it is a war zone. However, in an opposite sense, he does highlight that the War in Iraq opened up many more doors for research within social science.<sup>86</sup> Overall, the War in Iraq provided a useful opportunity for social science research, but that research was inhibited and its effectiveness was lessened due to the nature of Iraq itself, and Iraqi politics.

Before the War in Iraq, social science factored little in that particular area of the Middle East. Ahram argues, “Despite the ingenuity of its various practitioners, research on Iraq—much like the rest of Middle East studies—for many years had little presence in or impact on the wider theoretical debates in social science.”<sup>86</sup> The War in Iraq and social

---

<sup>85</sup> Ahram, Ariel. “Iraq in the Social Sciences: Testing the Limits of Research.” *Journal of the Middle East and Africa* 4.3 (2013): 251. Web.

<sup>86</sup> Ibid., 258.

science formed a symbiotic relationship, with the War in Iraq, as a workspace, aiding the development of the social sciences, and social science aiding the military and intelligence operations in Iraq. The findings of Ahram reiterate similar findings in Africa and Afghanistan.

Other theorists' findings seem to be exclusively positive in nature. Eric Bonds, associate professor of sociology for University of Mary Washington, states that social scientists have continued “import work to do in terms of calling attention to terrorizing violence and bringing it to the light.”<sup>87</sup> Due to their specific set of skills, relegated to their discipline, social scientists can deliver a positive impact on military and intelligence engagements. For example, sociologists, and other experts within cultural studies, may be able to “play a role—in whatever small way—in broader efforts to make humanitarian norms consequential.”<sup>88</sup> The consequences being that, when studied, patterns and protocols can result in extrapolation, projection, and forecasting for strategists in military and intelligence settings. After social science's use in Iraq, however, Bonds is skeptical that “public criticism and social movement activism may be able to create important challenges” to policies related to the use of social science in warfare, “potentially diminishing the extent of their use.”<sup>88</sup> In other words, while the impact of social science in the military and civil intelligence has been beneficial, controversy may diminish that level of positivity and inhibit its effectiveness abroad. This outcome does not seem to be tangible yet, with sociology, cultural studies, and related fields remaining a positive contribution to war zones.

---

<sup>87</sup> Bonds, Eric. “Terrorizing Violence and the Iraq War: Civilian Victimization, Humanitarian Norms, and Social Science.” *Humanity & Society* 38.4 (2014): 366. Web.

<sup>88</sup> Ibid., 367.

As a form of skepticism of social science's involvement in Iraq, Roberto Gonzalez offers a few points of contention. In “On 'tribes' and bribes: 'Iraq tribal study,' al-Anbar's awakening, and social science,” written for *Focaal*, he explains how so-called “tribal engagement” stems “primarily from officers with social science backgrounds, who occasionally cite anthropology as a crucial source.”<sup>89</sup> Rather than providing true expertise, the reality of the fact appears to be military commanders who have a vague appreciation and familiarity with the social sciences. Gonzalez cites an example where “US Army Lieutenant Colonel Michael Eisenstadt (2007) [wrote] an article on this topic for the *Military Review*, which includes a section titled 'Anthropology 101: What is a tribe?’”<sup>89</sup> This example is important, because it showcases the elementary understanding of social science that some commanders hold. Rather than showcasing expertise, only a limited level of understanding is found within certain commanders.

One of the best examples of how misunderstanding an adversary’s culture can have detrimental impacts on the battlefield is the War in Iraq. The result of this singular conflict was not only the collapse of local governance, but the destabilization of the region, as well. For those reasons, it proved to be a crucial target of study. Initially misunderstanding the culture with which the United States was engaging had problematic side effects, including the waste of funding and human lives. By applying the social sciences to the War in Iraq, and utilizing the expertise of cultural and social experts, a more efficient and effective approach could have been applied to the conflict.

Furthermore, before the expansion of the social sciences in application to the War in Iraq, and general military and civilian intelligence operations, combat effectiveness was

---

<sup>89</sup> Gonzalez, Roberto. “On 'tribes' and bribes: 'Iraq tribal study,' al-Anbar's awakening, and social science.” *Focaal* 53 (2009): 106. Web.

somewhat limited by comparison. So much so, in fact, that sitting commander David Petraeus noticed how a lack of social and cultural knowledge was key in military failings. As a result, subordinate and superior military and intelligence officials have taken note, and adjusted accordingly.

## **V: Conclusion**

The findings in the case studies pertaining to Africa, Afghanistan, and Iraq all appear to support the aforementioned literature surveyed. The present literature on the use of the social sciences in military and intelligence settings advocates for and supports its usefulness. After examining the outcomes in three environments pertaining to the War on Terror, the prevailing conclusion is that, while social science and Human Terrain Teams are not perfect, they are effective. There are criticisms to be found, but the overall impact of the discipline on the military and civil intelligence is positive. Overall, there are many more benefits than detriments, and operations are rendered more effective as a result.

Moving forward, conflict resolution will foreseeably be aided by social science. Since there is a value to be found in the social sciences and their application to intelligence, both experts and scholars alike have expanded the research materials pertaining to its usage in warzones. Turning toward the future, it is important to consider how the military and civilian intelligence communities will adjust and adhere to social science, now that it is proven to be effectual in warzones. Determining how best to move forward, given the established usefulness of social science in intelligence, is important, and may have positive effects that extend to commanders, intelligence officials, and citizens of foreign countries. Considering the work with which social scientists are

involved, the nature of how both military and civilian organizations are run, and the overall culture created and fostered within the broader intelligence community, social science may make a positive impact that is difficult to quantify.

Including the social sciences in the intelligence process, whether that means military or civil intelligence, increases the likelihood of mission success. Its absence, as is noted in Vietnam and the earlier years of the War in Iraq, has contributed to social and cultural friction, as well as a heightened probability of protest and anger among foreign citizens. On the other hand, its inclusion, especially in Afghanistan and other states within Africa and Central Asia, has enabled and empowered strategic operations. The impact made by social science on the intelligence process, and its implementation abroad, is a positive one. For that reason, academics and experts continue to expand the field of study. Since it produces a net positive impact on the broader field of intelligence, it will continue to grow and expand both in terms of its application in operations and as a point of study for academics.

## **Chapter 2: Assessing the Impact of Social Science on Domestic Intelligence and Federal Law Enforcement**

### **I: Introduction**

While mission creep and a diluted focus within an intelligence agency can pose significant problems, interdisciplinarity can sometimes be a worthwhile pursuit. In the case of domestic law enforcement, and particularly concerning the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI) and U.S. Marshals Service, integrating outside disciplines has proven effective. In some capacities, the inclusion of the social sciences has created a professional atmosphere where criminal profiling, predictive analysis, and job training are improved. Even though social sciences such as clinical and cognitive psychology, behavioral studies, and cultural studies are not directly tied to law enforcement and criminal justice, these disciplines can be useful in aiding domestic intelligence agencies. Especially after the September 11<sup>th</sup>, 2001 terrorist attacks on the World Trade Center and Pentagon, the FBI has expanded its use of social science in order to predict would-be criminals and catch ones who have already committed crimes. Even as a form of training, social science has provided insight into criminal mindsets, disorders, and other flawed mental patterning and disorders. Since its inception at the FBI's Training Division located in Quantico, Virginia in the 1970's, behavioral science, cultural studies, and related social sciences have blossomed into a massive subset of federal law enforcement and intelligence. Whether this means the establishment of dedicated departments, or the integration of social science into already existing departments, the post-9/11 relationship between federal law enforcement and intelligence is stronger than ever before. Judging the inclusion and expanded use of social science within domestic intelligence, it appears



as if the interdisciplinary approach to federal law enforcement has resulted in a net positive, a heightened sense of expediency, and a more precise understanding of criminal mindsets and behaviors.

## **II: Research Question**

How has social science impacted domestic intelligence, including federal law enforcement, after the terrorist attacks on September 11<sup>th</sup>, 2001?

## **III: Literature Review**

Before examining the results of social science's inclusion within domestic intelligence and law enforcement, it is important to survey the findings of experts within the field. This focused overview includes employees within criminal justice and domestic intelligence agencies, as well as scholars and academics within the fields of behavioral science, psychology, and cultural studies. By reflecting on their findings, contextualizing, clarifying, and historicizing supplemental information can be provided and set a framework for an investigation and analysis of social science's impact on domestic intelligence and federal law enforcement. At the very least, an overview of this kind sets several points of reference, and maps out a landscape of viewpoints and perspectives across multiple disciplines. Social science's use within domestic intelligence may be viewed by experts across disciplines as not just ineffective or effective, but as differently useful and worthwhile, and for unique reasons. A review of timely scholarly literature on the topic may provide insight into its recent impact on domestic intelligence and federal law enforcement.

Since the terror attacks on the United States in 2001, federal agencies have amplified their approach to studying behavioral and cultural patterns. For the purposes of

domestic intelligence, the study of behavior, cultural norms, and social normativity, have been amplified. In David Cunningham's "The Patterning of Repression: FBI Counterintelligence and the New Left," he explores emergent issues pertaining to the study of behavior. For example, he writes, "The literature on social movements and collective actions usefully recognizes that protest is an interactive clash between authorities and challengers. Most work in this area, however, has dealt with one side of this equation, focusing squarely on the challengers themselves."<sup>90</sup> Rather than dealing with the offenders themselves, Cunningham's text also disagrees with the prevailing narrative, and focuses on the actions of different authorities.<sup>90</sup>

Being able to predict emergent threats is also key. In another text by David Cunningham, along with Barb Browning, titled "The Emergence of Worthy Targets: Official Frames and Deviance Narratives within the FBI," setting a sense of perspective is critical in establishing predictive frameworks. The authors write, "Alongside political opportunities and threats, mobilizing structures, and repertoires of contention, framing processes have emerged as central components of models that seek to understand political contention in a wide range of contexts."<sup>91</sup> With this ability in mind, the FBI is able to set predictive frameworks and seek out would-be criminals with precision. According to "The Keynote Speaker for the American College of Forensic Examiners 4<sup>th</sup> Annual Scientific Meeting Will Be John Douglas, Retired Head of the FBI Behavioral Science Unit," by John Douglas, different behavioral traits can be used in order to stay ahead of

---

<sup>90</sup> Cunningham, David. "The Patterning of Repression: FBI Counterintelligence and the New Left." *Social Forces* 82.1 (2003): 209. Web.

<sup>91</sup> Cunningham, David, and Barb Browning. "The Emergence of Worthy Targets: Official Frames and Deviance Narratives within the FBI." *Sociological Forum* 19.3 (2004): 347. Web.

the game.<sup>92</sup> Douglas explains, agents “conducted the first organized study into the methods and motivations of serial criminals and [had] aided police departments and prosecutors throughout the world.”<sup>92</sup> The benefits of this approach are widespread, across different states and cultures.

From an overarching standpoint, the nature of this domestic intelligence enforcement program is cutting edge. In *Forensic Examiner's* “FBI Training At-A-Glance,”<sup>93</sup> and the text *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin's* “The FBI's Communicated Threat Assessment Database,” the study of different sent and received threats is examined. For instance, the latter article showcases how, “In conjunction with these responsibilities, the unit implemented CTAD to serve as the primary repository for all communicated threats and other criminally oriented communications (COCs) within the FBI.”<sup>94</sup> For many threats sent by would-be threats, and received by potential victims, they are stored and studied.

Using social science in order to find an edge with regards to predicting crime is critical. In a *Mother Jones* article titled “Trigger Warnings,” the idea of situations and conditions that could set off, or enable, criminals is explored.<sup>95</sup> The findings listed in that article are reinforced by Bryanna Fox's “What Have We Learned from Offender Profiling? A Systemic Review and Meta-Analysis of 40 Years of Research,” which was written for the *Psychological Bulletin*. In the text, Fox details how, over the period of several decades, profiling is effective, and can be put to work. Fox writes, “In the 4

---

<sup>92</sup> Douglas, John. “The Keynote Speaker for the American College of Forensic Examiners 4<sup>th</sup> Annual Scientific Meeting Will Be John Douglas, Retired Head of the FBI Behavioral Science Unit.” *Forensic Examiner* 5.3/4 (1996): 12. Web.

<sup>93</sup> “FBI Training Division At-A-Glance.” *Forensic Examiner* 19.3 (2010): 16-17. Web.

<sup>94</sup> Fitzgerald, James. “The FBI's Communicated Threat Assessment Database.” *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin* 78.2 (2007): 6. Web.

<sup>95</sup> Follman, Mark. “Trigger Warnings.” *Mother Jones* 40.6 (2015): 22. Web.

decade since offender profiling (OP) was established, hundreds of journal articles, books, book chapters, reports, and magazine articles have been published on the topic, and the technique has been used by countless law enforcement agencies around the globe.”<sup>96</sup> There is no question as to whether or not the use of this approach is helpful and beneficial.

High-risk intelligence investigations are a difficult activity with which to be engaged. Thankfully, according to Meredith Krause, author of “History and Evolution of the FBI's Undercover Safeguard Program,” there are training protocols in place designed to ease the nature of the job. She writes, “Since its inception in the 1980's, the FBI's Undercover Safeguard Program has provided assessment, selection, support, and training services to thousands of covert employees engaged in a range of high-risk investigations.”<sup>97</sup> Overall, the FBI is focused on training its agents to understand and identify factors that can help them spot specifically abusive criminals. This is reinforced by Simran Hans' article, “Killer Instinct,” which grounds itself in the nature of uniquely violent criminals.<sup>98</sup> The end result is a profiling system that achieves efficiency, and effectiveness, with regards to violent crimes.

According to the *Forensic Examiner*, the behavioral science unit of the FBI has been operating and effective at spotting criminals for decades.<sup>99</sup> This is echoed by Ewout Meijer's “Deception Detection with Behavioral, Autonomic, and Neural Measures: Conceptual and Methodological Considerations That Warrant Modesty.” While select

---

<sup>96</sup> Fox, Bryanna. “What Have We Learned from Offender Profiling? A Systemic Review and Meta-Analysis of 40 Years of Research.” *Psychological Bulletin* 144.12 (2018): 1247. Web.

<sup>97</sup> Krause, Meredith. “History and Evolution of the FBI's Undercover Safeguard Program.” *Consulting Psychology Journal: Practice and Research* 61.1 (2009): 5. Web.

<sup>98</sup> Hans, Simran. “Killer Instinct.” *Sight & Sound* 27.11 (2017): 36-39. Web.

<sup>99</sup> “Meet the FBI's Behavioral Science Unit.” *Forensic Examiner* 19.3 (2010): 12-15. Web.

shows, such as Netflix's *Mindhunter*, showcase social science's usefulness in law enforcement, he explains that “Attempts to use psychophysiological measures to detect deception can be traced back to over a hundred years ago.”<sup>100</sup> In other words, regardless of perceptions that this approach is new, the approach is quite old, and with a storied past.

The emotional side of predictive analysis is also key in finding criminals, and spotting criminal behavior early. “Crafting an 'Authentic' Monster: Dialogue, Genre and Ethical Questions in *Mindhunter*,”<sup>101</sup> by Erica Moulton, and “Emotional, Behavioral, and Cognitive Reactions to Microaggressions: Transgender Perspectives,” by Kevin Nadal, both establish that there are patterns to recognize in crime. All of these considerations are helpful for domestic intelligence. According to Nadal’s text, “the U.S. Department of Justice Federal Bureau of Investigations (FBI) 2011 Hate Crime Statistics, crimes directed against individuals on the basis of sexual orientation are the second most frequent hate crime committed.”<sup>102</sup> In addition to the fact that select individuals are more capable of certain crimes, it is also the case that some people are more likely to be victims.<sup>13</sup> This showcases a good use of the social sciences in crime analysis, and crime prediction.

Certain crimes can be predicted and stopped. At the very least, some crimes can be anticipated through the analysis of previous crimes. There is quite a bit of focus on potentially forthcoming crimes, but an often overlooked component within domestic intelligence is the study of crimes that have already been committed. The study of such

---

<sup>100</sup> Meijer, Ewout, et al. “Deception Detection with Behavioral, Autonomic, and Neural Measures: Conceptual and Methodological Considerations That Warrant Modesty.” *Psychophysiology* 53.5 (2016): 593. Web.

<sup>101</sup> Moulton, Erica. “Crafting an 'Authentic' Monster: Dialogue, Genre and Ethical Questions in *Mindhunter*.” *Journal of Screenwriting* 10.2 (2017): 195-212. Web.

<sup>102</sup> Nadal, Kevin, et al. “Emotional, Behavioral, and Cognitive Reactions to Microaggressions: Transgender Perspectives.” *Psychology of Sexual Orientation and Gender Diversity* 1.1 (2014): 72. Web.

crimes can be a crucial indicator of the crimes that are to come. One of the benefits to sources such as “Behavioral Legal Ethics,” written by Jennifer Robbennolt for the *Arizona State Law Journal*, is that it shows the intricacies of how behavioral studies is applied to law.<sup>103</sup> It is reinforced by sources such as “School Shooters Can Be Stopped: A Valuable New Resource,” written for the *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin*, which also showcases the ways in which predictive analysis can be applied to the law. In the *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin*, it is explained, “In the 20 years since Columbine, one of the biggest prevailing myths is that school shootings are unavoidable because no one ever sees them coming.”<sup>104</sup> Instead, it is the case that the social sciences can serve as a useful resource in domestic intelligence.

The usefulness of social science within domestic intelligence has such a profound past that there is a museum dedicated to its benefits. The *Forensic Examiner* article “The FBI Behavioral Science Unit's Evil Minds Research Museum” elaborates on how social science has strengthened the effectiveness of domestic intelligence.<sup>105</sup> Its many conclusions and findings are also strengthened by Michael Tierney's “Using Behavioral Analysis to Prevent Violent Extremism: Assessing the Cases of Michael Zehaf-Bibeau and Aaron Driver.” In this article, written for the *Journal of Threat Assessment and Management*, different identifiers are highlighted. Tierney explains, “Several analysts found that variables such as anger over foreign policy, increasing religiosity, social alienation, a desire to protect others, and a sense of adventure could incite an individual

---

<sup>103</sup> Robbennolt, Jennifer. “Behavioral Legal Ethics.” *Arizona State Law Journal* 45.3 (2013): 1107-1182. Web.

<sup>104</sup> “School Shooters Can Be Stopped: A Valuable New Resource.” *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin* (2019): 22. Web.

<sup>105</sup> “The FBI Behavioral Science Unit's Evil Minds Research Museum.” *Forensic Examiner* 19.3 (2010): 18-19. Web.

to conduct attacks in the name of an ideology.”<sup>106</sup> By focusing on such behaviors and beliefs, preemptive approaches to crime can be taken.

Other factors are taken into consideration with regards to behavioral, cultural, and social issues pertaining to domestic intelligence. For the purposes of homeland security, behavioral analysis also benefits emergency management.<sup>107</sup> This is the conclusion articulated in Darren Tromblay’s article, “Fixing a Failure to Identify Intelligence in the Domestic Setting: Aligning Collection and Analysis to Address an All-Hazards Mission.” It is echoed by Gregory Vecchi’s “The FBI Behavioral Science Unit’s Approach to World-Class Training,” as well. One of the key focuses is not only what is found, after extensive research, but how effectively it can be communicated to audiences in “an efficient and effective manner.”<sup>108</sup> Vecchi reiterates this in an additional article of his, titled, “The FBI Behavioral Science Unit’s Evil Minds Research Museum,” which is written for *The Forensic Examiner*.<sup>109</sup> In the widely varying field that is the social sciences, one of additional focuses is the ability to teach and communicate certain ideas to those who will listen.<sup>109</sup> An inability to do so may result in ineffectiveness in research and discoveries.

By surveying the scholarly texts available pertaining to the inclusion of the social sciences in domestic intelligence and law enforcement, points of reference are established

---

<sup>106</sup> Tierney, Michael. “Using Behavioral Analysis to Prevent Violent Extremism: Assessing the Cases of Michael Zehaf-Bibeau and Aaron Driver.” *Journal of Threat Assessment and Management* 4.2 (2017): 98. Web.

<sup>107</sup> Tromblay, Darren. “Fixing a Failure to Identify Intelligence in the Domestic Setting: Aligning Collection and Analysis to Address an All-Hazards Mission.” *Homeland Security & Emergency Management* 12.2 (2015): 241-255. Web.

<sup>108</sup> Vecchi, Gregory. “The FBI Behavioral Science Unit’s Approach to World-Class Training.” *The Forensic Examiner* 19.3 (2010): 75. Web.

<sup>109</sup> Vecchi, Gregory and Steven Conlon. “The FBI Behavioral Science Unit’s Evil Minds Research Museum.” *The Forensic Examiner* 19.3 (2010): 18-19. Web.

across several disciplines. This interdisciplinary approach includes counterintelligence, behavioral studies pertaining to deviance and criminal mindsets, domestic terrorism, law enforcement training, and psychology, among others. The prevailing conclusion across many of these texts is that social science is differently useful, varying from field to field. For some disciplines, it has contributed to significant improvements, while for others, it has been useful, but not as useful as strong examples found within the FBI Behavioral Sciences Unit. Overall, the sentiments provided by professionals, scholars, and experts across different fields and disciplines is that social science has made a positive impact on domestic intelligence that has only grown stronger since the start of the War on Terror.

#### **IV: Theoretical Framework, Methodology & Limitations**

The theoretical framework of this thesis chapter is grounded in the partnership between security studies and social science. While the partnership is transactional, and there is much to be gleaned by social scientists by applying their fields of study to domestic intelligence, the primary focus is on the benefits and positive impacts to professions and disciplines within domestic intelligence and federal law enforcement. In addition to disciplines related to security, behavioral studies, cultural studies, and psychology, among others, are involved in order to create an interdisciplinary investigation of the research question. The prevailing suspicion is that social science is both applicable, and increasingly indispensable, to domestic intelligence and federal law enforcement. Domestic applications of social science to professions and entire fields related to intelligence tends to be less popular in nature when compared to its successful use abroad in the War on Terror.



The primary contributions of this thesis chapter to this area of study is to showcase and potentially popularize the use of social science within varying disciplines related to domestic intelligence. The use of social science in intelligence is controversial, with some experts finding its usage within intelligence disrespectful to the field, as if it is an abuse of the field. On the other hand, experts working within domestic intelligence and federal law enforcement often appear to focus on how beneficial cultural, social, and ethnical expertise can be within their professions. In order to explore the validity of these claims, research into the impact of social science on domestic intelligence will involve analyzing texts such as peer-reviewed journal articles, news articles, bulletins from within the FBI, and related textual publications.

Despite the broad field of experts that will be researched in order to understand whether or not social science has positively contributed to domestic intelligence, there are limitations to this study. The first, and most significant issue, is that many documents, findings, operations, and entire endeavors within intelligence settings are classified at varying levels of severity. Even for relatively low-risk information, deemed “confidential,” there is essentially no way in which the public can obtain access. This means that, for all security levels ranging from “confidential” to “top secret,” there is an inherent gap within the research. Except for those who have access, it cannot be said whether there is evidence to support the belief that social science is a beneficial contribution to domestic intelligence. Otherwise, in addition to the issue of inaccessible classified materials, it should also be noted that domestic intelligence agencies are less likely to popularize their shortcomings and failings, and that they may strategically conceal their success. From a strategic standpoint, if the FBI or U.S. Marshals are

comparatively inept in a particular subcategory of research, there is a low likelihood that they would popularize this gap in their own knowledge. While it may be generally possible to spot failings and detrimental impacts for researchers and academics, some failures and weak points within domestic intelligence agencies may be concealed to lower the likelihood of being exploited. The same can most likely be said for areas in which domestic intelligence agencies have made considerable advancements. Popularizing and showcasing advanced techniques provides little to no strategic value, meaning that another gap in the research is likely to exist.

## **V: Results**

There appears to be a proven track record of social science's usefulness in domestic intelligence and making positive impacts wherever it is applied. Similar to the findings surveyed in the literature review, further research confirms that social science is helpful for various departments and agencies. However, it is important to define what it means to be helpful. For one example, the FBI uses social science in order to profile would-be criminals, and to study the mindsets of captured killers in order to study the nature of their cognitive defects, as well as if they are likely to be repeat offenders. The U.S. Marshals developed a similar Behavioral Analysis Unit in 2008, except its focus is primarily on "fugitive and non-compliant sex offenders."<sup>110</sup> Additionally, the U.S. Marshals list having "graduate level study related to ... sociology" as a qualifying educational background.<sup>111</sup> The Department of Homeland Security also created its own social science unit in 2003, the Human Factors and Behavioral Sciences Division (HFD),

---

<sup>110</sup> "Acting Director of the U.S. Marshals Service: Who is David Harlow?" *AllGov*. 20 Feb. 2017. Web. 15 Oct. 2019.

<sup>111</sup> "Qualifications." *U.S. Marshals Service*. N.d. Web. 15 Oct. 2019.

which centers itself on security threats and domestic terrorism.<sup>112</sup> This pattern of agencies establishing customized social science departments and divisions is indicative of the field of study having worth and value in domestic intelligence. When personalized to the liking and overall mission of an agency, social science is beneficial for mapping out predictable criminal behavior, and increases the effectiveness of tracking violent criminals, sex offenders, and domestic terrorists.

The FBI has found usefulness in studying the mindsets and behaviors of murderers. In an FBI interview of Mark A. Hilts, a retired special agent within the Behavioral Analysis Unit-2 (BAU-2), lead by Mollie Halpern, who works for the FBI Office of Public Affairs, the details of just how contributory social science is to federal law enforcement is explored.<sup>113</sup> As graphic as it may seem, it is important to understand individual violent crimes so that the big picture can be assessed and analyzed. For example, Hilts asks the rhetorical questions, “Why would somebody kill 10 different people over a year’s time period? What kind of person would chop somebody up, or would carve something into a victim, or would do some other bondage or other type of activity?”<sup>113</sup> It is no stretch to say that such behaviors are unpleasant to think about, let alone make the basis of one’s career, but reaching a better understanding of them may help in preventing them from happening in the future. Overall, Hilts states, “it’s something that, as normal beings, we struggle with, we don’t understand.”<sup>113</sup> For people who do not suffer from these cognitive and behavioral defects, it is difficult to comprehend why someone may turn to extreme acts of violence. However, for the

---

<sup>112</sup> “Science & Technology Directorate Human Factors/Behavioral Sciences Division.” *Department of Homeland Security*. 31 Jan. 2011. Web. 15 Oct. 2019.

<sup>113</sup> Halpern, Mollie and Mark A. Hilts. “Behavioral Analysts.” *Federal Bureau of Investigation*. 2 May 2011. Web. 12 Oct. 2019.

perpetrators of those violent crimes, the important consideration is that it makes sense. For them, it is normal, not out of the ordinary, or possibly even thrilling in a variety of capacities. In order to lower the likelihood of these crimes, the FBI has continued to strengthen its usage of the social science in recent decades.

By involving and immersing themselves in the most deviant and violent behaviors, the FBI actively develops a heightened level of expertise.<sup>113</sup> Studying “those types of cases that a police investigator doesn’t see every day: a child abduction, a serial murder, a serial rape case,” provides a level of specialty to which standard law enforcement is not routinely exposed.<sup>113</sup> The agents who specialize in these sorts of crimes, and apply social science, “became known as FBI profilers, and they were looking at the crime from the behavioral aspect.”<sup>113</sup> Using behavioral, cultural, and ethnical awareness to drive their investigations and studies, the questions of FBI profilers often revolve around, “What’s the meaning behind the activities at a crime scene? Why was a particular person victimized? Were they specifically targeted by this individual, or were they simply a victim of opportunity in the wrong place at the wrong time?”<sup>113</sup> In addressing these questions, patterns of behavior can be established, even if in part, justifications and reasoning can be explored, and sense can be made of what often seem to be senseless violent crimes. All of this research contributes to an aggregated sum of knowledge and intelligence that may be contributory to further developing domestic intelligence’s study of social science.

An important consideration is that the nature of the FBI’s study of social science is not to solve crimes, but rather to build on their knowledge.<sup>113</sup> In addition to working

---

<sup>113</sup> Halpern, Mollie and Mark A. Hilts. “Behavioral Analysts.” *Federal Bureau of Investigation*. 2 May 2011. Web. 12 Oct. 2019.

with “an outside board of scientific and academic experts that work [with the FBI] to ensure that our research is valid and is scientifically and academically accepted,” the FBI uses its applications of social science to help other agencies and departments within law enforcement. Intelligence sharing is common within domestic intelligence, but the FBI takes it a step further by providing “at least a dozen services to local law enforcement, and each one is tailored to the individual case.”<sup>113</sup> The special agents associated with social science “collaborate on cases with the locals, unlike the way BAU is portrayed on popular shows.”<sup>113</sup> Hilts explains this practice of working with local and state law enforcement, stating, “We’re going to come out, we’re going to meet with them, we’re going to talk with them, we’re going to provide them our assistance, but we do not take over the case.”<sup>113</sup> Rather than assume control, the goal of the FBI is to put their research to good use, and to be a resource available to lend expertise. In doing so, their study of social science can be brought into the field, and tested in a variety of manners for the sake of validating or invalidating their prior findings.

In the years since the War on Terror began, the FBI and other domestic intelligence agencies have expanded their research into social science. This expansion pertains to funding, manpower and effort, working with various forms of law enforcement, and building upon a database verified by academics and scholars within the field of social science. The result is that the study of the field, as a craft, is increasingly refined, builds upon an aggregate database, is subject to verification and peer-review, and tested in the field. Mirroring the findings in the literature review portion of this chapter, the FBI reinforces the useful and beneficial nature of studying social science. FBI special

---

<sup>113</sup> Halpern, Mollie and Mark A. Hilts. “Behavioral Analysts.” *Federal Bureau of Investigation*. 2 May 2011. Web. 12 Oct. 2019.

agents are building upon their successes, studying their failures, and exploring new applications of social science within domestic intelligence.

Continuing along a similar vein, the FBI also produces materials that can help citizens in the age of terrorism. The FBI published the article, “The Homegrown Threat: Booklet Lists Observable Indicators of Potential Violent Extremists.” In it, there is a “list of nearly four dozen observable behavioral signs that someone might be planning to commit an act of extremist violence.”<sup>114</sup> Similar to how the FBI also works with other agencies and various levels of law enforcement, it is also beginning to build a stronger relationship with the public. In a collaborative effort with the National Counterterrorism Center and the Department of Homeland Security, the booklet “contains a broad list of 46 behavioral indicators listed in color-coded groupings of how clearly the indicators might demonstrate an individual’s likelihood of engaging in terrorist activity.”<sup>114</sup> While the first version was released in 2017, an updated version was released in order to help law enforcement “and the public at large” identify, confirm, and report suspicious behaviors.<sup>114</sup> The booklet also helps users understand whether the suspicious behavior is sensitive or not, with rankings of imminent, near-term, and long-term.<sup>114</sup> These efforts are indicative of expansive and forward-thinking approaches to the use of data and information gathered by domestic intelligence agencies.

Similar to the FBI, the Department of Homeland Security has also experienced its own successes by studying social science. Created in the wake of the September 11<sup>th</sup>, 2001 terrorist attacks, the Human Factors and Behavioral Sciences Division is designed to use social science in an effort to prevent domestic terrorism and mass acts of violence.

---

<sup>114</sup> “The Homegrown Threat: Booklet Lists Observable Indicators of Potential Violent Extremists.” *Federal Bureau of Investigation*. 16 Jul. 2019. Web. 12 Oct. 2019.

The Department of Homeland Security article, “Radical Research: Understanding Origins of Terrorism,” explains its own use of social science. It explains that understanding “terrorist intent and behavior, and how radicalization leads to violence, is a top priority” for their agency.”<sup>115</sup> Some of the triggers that initiate violence vary widely. For example, extremist violence and domestic terrorism can be caused by perceived “victimization, political grievances, and joining radical groups.”<sup>115</sup> If one or more of these conditions is met, it can lead to a “slippery slope of increasingly radical behaviors.”<sup>115</sup> Furthermore, in order to aid the Department of Homeland Security, there is a “collaborative effort between four National Labs called the Group Violent Intent Modeling Project.”<sup>115</sup> They draw “on the theories and data of the social and behavioral sciences,” helping “researchers use advanced modeling and simulation techniques to examine influences on future terror behavior.”<sup>115</sup> So far, this has helped the agency “uncover valid behavioral indicators” that may point to a willingness to commit violent crimes or acts of domestic terrorism.<sup>115</sup> In a manner that echoes the advancements made by the FBI, the Department of Homeland Security has increased and expanded its efforts, with social science contributing to their ability to prevent and solve crimes.

Aside from select, and comparatively rare, instances of social scientists expressing criticism of the discipline’s use within warfare, intelligence, and law enforcement, many experts within the field express praise instead. According to an article stored within the NCJRS, or the National Criminal Justice Reference Service, titled “Into the Minds of Madmen: How the FBI’s Behavioral Science Unit Revolutionized Crime Investigation,” the use of social science has been imperative in improving law

---

<sup>115</sup> “Radical Research: Understanding Origins of Terrorism.” *Department of Homeland Security*. 6 Jul. 2009. Web. 12 Oct. 2019.

enforcement. The author, Don DeNevi, explains that, like the title suggests, the FBI revolutionized law enforcement and criminal investigations by expanding the use of behavioral science.<sup>116</sup> With the unit's track record in mind, he explains that the behavioral science unit "has been perfecting the art and science of criminal profiling."<sup>116</sup> One of the key benefits of the behavioral science division established at the FBI's training facility is the idea of nuance. The author is deliberate in stating that criminal profiling is both an "art" and a "science." Scientifically speaking, the behavioral science unit has worked in tandem with academics and other experts working within social science. The reason behind this decision is to make sure that their work is scientifically sound, and that there is a mitigated chance of inaccuracies and related blunders. There is a difference between conducting research and interviews, and accurately establishing literature on the topic. In an effort to make sure that the latter is correct, the FBI worked together with social scientists. Together, they began to establish scientific literature concerning criminal behavior ranging from low level deviance to serial murders. On the other hand is the art of the matter, where interviewers and researchers must use feelings and gut decision-making skills in order to further the research. Rather than conducting interviews in a formulaic manner, for example, some researchers may find it best to diverge from the scripts with which they are provided and ask questions that are more "off the cuff" in nature. In a blended effort, there is a science and art to working within the behavioral science units within the FBI.

In an effort to disseminate their research to other agencies and branches of law enforcement, the FBI works with others. According to the text, the behavioral science

---

<sup>116</sup> DeNevi, Don. "Into the Minds of Madmen: How the FBI's Behavioral Science Unit Revolutionized Crime Investigation." Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 2004. Web.



unit “continues to offer specialized and applied training to members of the law enforcement community.”<sup>116</sup> The primary means of disseminating research to law enforcement comes in two varieties: specialized focuses, as well as applied training. What this means is that the FBI can custom tailor its ability to teach others, all based on their select needs. No matter what their specific division, focus, or goal, the FBI can offer training that can help. Also, it can offer applied training, as well, which means that the FBI parts ways with the theoretical and educational side of their behavioral research, and shows law enforcement how to actually use their findings in the field. Both approaches play an important role, with neither side being any more important or unimportant than the other. In a sort of symbiotic relationship, the theory and applied training both work together in order to help law enforcement.

There is also an extensive amount of preparatory work involved with become a member of the behavioral science unit, making the division of the FBI both highly coveted, and highly guarded. According to Mary Ellen O’Toole, who is a former FBI profiler, it is impossible to become a member of the behavioral science unit without first going “through the FBI Academy, which is approximately 4 months long.”<sup>117</sup> The training involved in becoming a member of the behavioral science unit, however, eventually involves, “psychology, interviewing, and legal issues.”<sup>117</sup> Psychology plays an integral role in the training to become a member of the unit, largely because the unit is rooted in social science at its core. In order to illustrate just how selective and serious the behavioral science unit is, O’Toole explains, “Most profilers working the BAU have

---

<sup>116</sup> DeNevi, Don. “Into the Minds of Madmen: How the FBI’s Behavioral Science Unit Revolutionized Crime Investigation.” Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 2004. Web.

<sup>117</sup> O’Toole, Mary Ellen. “Becoming an FBI Profiler.” *Mary Ellen O’Toole*. 13 Oct. 2011. Web. 5 Nov. 2019.

between seven and fifteen years of investigative experience before transferring to the BAU.”<sup>117</sup> In other words, outside of having extensive experience in academia or a related field that is heavily involved in social science, a decorated background is required of FBI agents who decide to venture into behavioral science. It is not an entry-level position, but rather one oriented towards employees who are seasoned. Adding to the requirements is the fact that “The FBI requires a four-year college degree in any major in order to apply for the Agent position.”<sup>117</sup> However, once in, agents can perform a variety of tasks, ranging from standard interviews, to analysis, and even to writing and public speaking.<sup>117</sup> Despite requiring a minimum of approximately eleven, or more, years of experience and education, “Many FBI Agents apply to work in the BAU.”<sup>117</sup> Overall, working within the behavioral science unit “is a competitive process and many factors are considered.”<sup>117</sup> For that reason, the entire employment process is both complex and complicated, making the job one that is closely guarded and held to higher standards. In combination with DeNevi’s text, O’Toole showcases how serious the matter of establishing and applying behavioral research is for the FBI.

The work of the FBI, given its ability to apply social science research to the field, has been recognized by publications such as *Psychology Today*. Scott A. Bonn, Ph.D., is the author of “Criminal Profiling: The Original Mind Hunters.” He writes that many recent fictions, such as *The Silence of the Lambs* and *Mindhunter* are based on “the writings of best-selling author Mark Olshaker and legendary FBI profiler John Douglas.”<sup>118</sup> Functioning outside of academia and the FBI itself, *Psychology Today* has

---

<sup>117</sup> O’Toole, Mary Ellen. “Becoming an FBI Profiler.” *Mary Ellen O’Toole*. 13 Oct. 2011. Web. 5 Nov. 2019.

<sup>118</sup> Bonn, Scott A. “Criminal Profiling: The Original Mind Hunters.” *Psychology Today*. 4 Dec. 2017. Web. 6 Nov. 2019.

published articles on the positive impact made by agents such as Robert Ressler and Roy Hazelwood, in addition to John Douglas.<sup>118</sup> Since their initial work in the early 1970s, the behavioral science unit has also “essentially invented computer-based, modern-day criminal profiling” that started in the 1980s.<sup>118</sup> While it is common to believe that computer technology was still in its infancy in the 1980s, the behavioral science unit of the FBI was forward thinking enough to use computational science in order to aid in creating criminal profiles. Similar to the very nature of the behavioral science unit itself, the use of computers in order to apply behavioral science to law enforcement was a step that had the future of studying criminal behavior in mind. Bonn’s article continues to praise the achievements and advancements made by the behavioral science unit, however he does raise some concerns. Rather than focusing on the ethics and morality of applying social science to law enforcement, as some academics and experts within the field have done, he instead insists that behavioral science is a “relatively new field.”<sup>29</sup> For that reason, there are “few set boundaries or definitions.”<sup>118</sup> While experts within the fields of psychology, sociology, cultural studies, and behavioral studies are all highly credentialed and qualified, there can often be points of contention. However, this is not to say that social science has not had a positive impact on law enforcement, but rather that this level of disagreement is healthy. With this sort of disagreement and debate among experts, points of reference are established and growth is achieved. Bonn states that practitioners “of criminal profiling do not always agree on methodology, procedures or even basic terminology.”<sup>118</sup> Although, despite “their disagreements, however, practitioners of profiling all share a common goal of analyzing evidence gathered at a crime scene and

---

<sup>118</sup> Bonn, Scott A. “Criminal Profiling: The Original Mind Hunters.” *Psychology Today*. 4 Dec. 2017. Web. 6 Nov. 2019.

statements provided by victims and witnesses to develop a description of an unknown offender.”<sup>118</sup> The chief goal for these experts, and the behavioral science unit as a whole, is to predict criminal behaviors, create profiles, and catch offenders. The net impact, despite any particularities, is still positive and beneficial for the greater law enforcement community.

Despite points of contention, there is a positive impact to be acknowledged on behalf of the behavioral science unit. In another article from *Psychology Today*, titled “Origin of the Term ‘Serial Killer,’” Bonn explores new definitions and terminologies. The very origin of the term “serial killer,” which is in the lexicon of Western culture, was created by the relatively recent behavioral science unit.<sup>119</sup> Academics and experts within the field of social science have agreed on certain particularities, such as the difference between mass murderers and serial killers.<sup>119</sup> For instance, unlike acts of mass murder, “serial killing involves multiple incidents of homicide—committed in separate events and crime scenes—where the perpetrator experiences an emotional cooling-off period between murders.”<sup>119</sup> During this “cooling-off period,” so-to-speak, the serial killer “returns to his/her seemingly normal life.”<sup>119</sup> Definitions such as these may appear to be ordinary and mundane, due to a sense of familiarity within Western culture, but they are important for helping law enforcement compartmentalize violent behaviors. By establishing definitions such as these, which are used by local, state, and federal law enforcement, the behavioral science unit has provided a framework within which to

---

<sup>118</sup> Bonn, Scott A. “Criminal Profiling: The Original Mind Hunters.” *Psychology Today*. 4 Dec. 2017. Web. 6 Nov. 2019.

<sup>119</sup> Bonn, Scott A. “Origin of the Term ‘Serial Killer.’” *Psychology Today*. 9 Jun. 2014. Web. 6 Nov. 2019.

operate. It is further evidence of a positive impact made to law enforcement, and law enforcement-based intelligence, on behalf of the FBI's use of social science.

## **VI: Discussion of Results**

The results of studying whether or not the FBI's use of social science within the discipline of law enforcement, and domestic intelligence, has made a positive impact is clear. It is clear in the sense that the use of behavioral science, psychology, cultural studies, and related fields of study have aided all tiers of law enforcement in a variety of manners. Whether it means establishing criminal profiles, so that law enforcement can compartmentalize and expedite their searches for violent offenders, or providing tools for law enforcement to conduct more effective interviews with criminals, there is a wide array of benefits to be found. Beginning with the training process itself, and the ability to even become a member of the behavioral science unit, the use of social science within domestic intelligence and federal law enforcement has become highly refined in comparison to its inception in the mid twentieth century. After what is a competitive and difficult application process, successful applicants must then receive extensive training over the duration of months. As a result, the current behavioral science unit is college-educated, trained in a generalized sense, and then the recipient of further, more specialized, training in order to even join the behavioral science unit as a novice.

As a result, departments involved in behavioral science, whether that means working for the FBI, the U.S. Marshals, or another agency, are refined. In order to ensure that their impact is an accurate and effective one, employees within behavioral science units are also subjected to academic levels of scrutiny so that it is ensured that their work is of a high quality. Working in tandem with actual scientists and academics within social

science, the already refined behavioral science unit employees have their work peer-reviewed by some of the foremost experts in the field. The end product is a trustworthy, and reliable, series of findings that are then tested in the field, and then further customized and refined over time.

Rather than inhibiting state and local law enforcement, the research produced by behavioral science unit employees within federal law enforcement and intelligence have the ability to help, rather than hinder. Behavioral studies research, as well as other findings linked to social science, are disseminated to law enforcement departments all across the country in an effort to aid them. This dissemination is one of the crowning achievements of the FBI, the U.S. Marshals, and other agencies studying the use and application of social science. They are able to take their highly funded, ruthlessly verified and peer-reviewed research, and enrich state and local police departments. Many state and especially local law enforcement departments lack the funding and the personnel in order to conduct similar research themselves, and this dissemination of research and field reports can be invaluable to those departments that do not have the means themselves. There is not only a net positive impact in applying social science to domestic intelligence and federal law enforcement, but there are tangible results in the form of having a higher likelihood of catching violent criminals and sex offenders, expediting the process of finding said criminals, and aiding in the research process itself. The FBI, among other agencies, is able to have their efforts reciprocated by law enforcement departments, because the law enforcement departments that apply the FBI's techniques and approaches to the field can then, in return, report on what was effective or ineffective. The relationship is an immense one, which requires an extensive series of partnerships, but

the amount of research and “real world” findings has created an environment of exponentially expanding facts, figures, data, and information. Much of which, in fact, is sent to domestic intelligence agencies for review, and contributes to the further refining of criminal profiling and practices within the field. This symbiotic relationship is an effective one, creating a positive impact that is tremendously helpful for all tiers of law enforcement.

In addition to the widespread networking of experts within the field, the training process, and dissemination, an additional positive impact is the level of specificity that can be applied to social science. The FBI, U.S. Marshals, and the Department of Homeland Security, all have their specific focuses, and behavioral and social sciences have been helpful for all of them, in addition to other agencies. Behavioral science, and the social sciences, are not a monolithic entity, or a standalone department functioning by itself. Rather, whether speaking with regards to the military, foreign intelligence, or domestic intelligence and law enforcement, seemingly any agency or department can benefit from the inclusion of social science. There does not appear to be any agency or department that has suffered as a result of integrating social science into its studies, approaches, or procedures. Rather, there only ever appears to be a positive impact made to the agencies and departments in question. Regardless of their specific focus as an entity, the FBI, the Department of Homeland Security, and the U.S. Marshals can all customize social science in order to suit their needs.

## **VII: Conclusion**

In assessing the impact of using social science in order to aid federal law enforcement and domestic intelligence, there appears to be little evidence of detriments

and concerns, and an abundance of evidence that its use is instead both positive and effective. One of the only key concerns raised by experts claiming that social science should not be used in either foreign or domestic intelligence is that it is unethical, or a breach of an unwritten moral code. However, from the research conducted, and the results explored, it is difficult to find evidence that supports those claims. Ethics and morality are subjective, and oftentimes custom and dynamic across people and groups, so any blanket claim made about the morality of using social science in domestic intelligence is unfounded and unsubstantiated. There is no evidence to support the belief that social science has been used in nefarious activities, for unethical goals. Rather, on the contrary, social science appears to have a net positive effect on all tiers of law enforcement, as well as domestic intelligence. It has aided agencies and departments in creating increasingly specific criminal profiles, has expedited the process of searching for criminals, and has even provided a means of predicting criminal behavior in would-be offenders. These achievements have produced a tangibly noticeable effect on law enforcement, as well as increased the likelihood that criminals are caught. In using an interdisciplinary approach to social science in domestic intelligence and federal law enforcement, it appears to be the case that there has been a beneficial impact, overall, in a widely varying and multifaceted nature.



## **Chapter 3: The Impact of Social Science in Government Training and Education: Police Intelligence, and Local and State Law Enforcement**

### **I. Introduction**

Lingering misconceptions surrounding law enforcement and police intelligence suggest that there is too much focus on apprehending criminals, engaging in violent confrontations, and upholding the law in the field. However, with the expanded use of social science within police work and intelligence, social sciences such as cultural studies, psychology, and sociology, are illustrating that there is a deepened level of thoughtfulness, cultural awareness and consideration, and research that fosters a heightened understanding of the individuals in which one is tasked with policing. Similar to the FBI, which is often showcased for its storied history of violent confrontations and solving crimes, or special forces, which are rarely showcased for their ability to study and appeal to various cultures found within warzones, various levels of law enforcement, ranging from local police to the DEA, are not typically paired with their work in the fields of cultural studies, behavioral analysis, psychology, and additional social sciences. Investigating the impact of the social sciences on various levels of law enforcement and police intelligence supports the idea that the underbelly of those fields is supported by vast amounts of research into police culture, stress levels and cultural differences within police management, the usefulness of psychology in training new officers and agents, and the social psychology of communities being policed and how they perceive law enforcement officers, to name a few benefits. The impact of social science is widely varying, similar to the results found pertaining to civilian foreign intelligence, military intelligence, domestic intelligence, and federal law enforcement. Rather than relying

upon stereotypical conceptions of law enforcement and intelligence, research indicates that the activities, training, and education that underlies their operations showcases how social science defies those expectations.

## **II. Research Questions**

In training and educating government employees working in the fields of law enforcement and police intelligence, how is social science being used to make an impact? Across fields related to law enforcement and police intelligence, are there any gaps or limitations to the use of social science? Are there any opportunities for improvement or expansion regarding the use of social science in these fields?

## **III. Theoretical Framework, Methods & Considerations**

The theoretical framework and methodology of this chapter are rooted in viewing law enforcement and police intelligence through the lenses provided by social science. It examines a wide array of case studies, ranging from local law enforcement, to generalized trends within law enforcement, and to major police intelligence networks, such as the DEA, ATF, and Secret Service. Studying the use of social science in this manner, across different tiers of law enforcement and police intelligence, may provide insight into the impact made by fields such as psychology, sociology, cultural studies, and more. Examples of local law enforcement, such as Baltimore, Maryland and Ferguson, Missouri, using social science in their training processes and education of newly hired law enforcement officers, illuminates how useful the area of knowledge can be for national- and local-level policing efforts.

The two primary sources of information are case studies which showcase social science being used, as well as materials from agencies and law enforcement entities

themselves. These two sources of information are used, because it allows agencies such as the Drug Enforcement Agency and Secret Service to speak for themselves, and to educate the public on how integral of a role social sciences such as psychology, behavioral studies, and others, play in their fields. Additionally, other academics and experts have reported on the use of social science in the field, for training purposes, and within police intelligence efforts. These experts, which range from writing for the Yale School of Law to other journals related to criminology and policing, reinforce the statements and evidence provided by legal entities. Overall, this combined approach, with an interdisciplinary focus in mind, showcases how social science is being used to make an impact in the fields of law enforcement and police intelligence.

There are considerations and limitations to mention when considering the findings in this chapter. One such consideration is that policing, whether speaking in reference to the individuals doing the policing or the public being policed themselves, have different experiences across races and ethnicities, classes, and genders. Therefore, the cases studied and the perspectives reviewed should be taken more as glimpses into law enforcement, police intelligence, and the impact of social science, rather than universal truths. The findings in this chapter generally capture a sense of accuracy, but the level of complexity and complicatedness to both social science and policing is challenging.

#### **IV. Literature Review**

##### **Local Law Enforcement and Intelligence**

Social science has been used to provide additional lenses through which to study policing within and around Baltimore, Maryland. In Michael Buozi's article, "'Bizarre Dissonances in Baltimore': Class and Race in the Color-blind Discourses of Police

Violence,” matters of race, class, and culture are used to better understand local law enforcement and police intelligence practices. From a cultural standpoint, Buozis criticizes politicized reactions to instances of police violence, explaining that “conservative media construct racism as an individual psychological failing, often a failing of people of color in public life.”<sup>120</sup> There seems to be a tendency to rely more upon explaining “away any disparities as a result of socioeconomic class,” rather than focusing primarily on race, which Buozis feels is paramount in instances of police violence.<sup>120</sup> Furthermore, culture can be altered and tweaked in order to demonize select participants of protests. In the case of Freddie Gray, the “protestors in the black community of West Baltimore are not portrayed as citizens with legitimate complaints about policing but as ‘unworthy victims.’”<sup>120</sup> For Buozis, analysis could be enriched and deepened with a wide spread application of social sciences, not just a few fields within the domain. He touches base on psychological issues, “sociocultural flaws,” race-related issues within the “black community,” and more, noting how different political factions weaponized different lenses to suit their narratives and biases.<sup>120</sup> By using multiple lenses, the uses and abuses of social science within local law enforcement and police intelligence can be better understood, providing a clearer, more objective picture of incidents and scenarios.

Some experts within the field of criminology and cultural studies are doubtful that community is as effective as claimed, or that it may be altogether ineffectual. In a report written for George Mason University, David Weisburd and Charlotte Gill state that, using “evidence-based policy,” community policing is not an effective “strategy to reduce

---

<sup>120</sup> Buozis, Michael. “‘Bizarre Dissonances in Baltimore’: Class and Race in the Color-blind Discourses of Police Violence.” *Democratic Communiqué* 27 (2018): 41. Web.

crime.”<sup>121</sup> Rather, the conclusion of their article, “Rethinking the Conclusion that Community Policing Does Not Reduce Crime: Experimental Evidence of Crime Reporting Inflation,” claims that community-based policing resulted in a rise in reported crimes.<sup>121</sup> The idea behind community policing is that there may be a better relationship between law enforcement and members of the community if law enforcement officers themselves originate from the culture in which they are policing. At the surface level, this appears to be a good idea, similar to the use of Human Terrain Teams (HTT) abroad in both the War in Iraq and War in Afghanistan. The end result, if effective, could create a “culture of responsibility” by “connecting police interventions with the development of informal social controls.”<sup>122</sup> Overall, Weisburd and Gill did discover that “the police did succeed at increasing community collaboration and collective action in doing something about problems.”<sup>123</sup> There was a higher likelihood of police collaboration in areas that adopted community policing programs, and more citizens were likely to speak with officers about perceived or actual legal issues.<sup>123</sup> However, the authors state, “But when we looked at the crime outcomes of the program, we did not find evidence of crime prevention.”<sup>123</sup> Responses to crimes were more effective, and police experienced a greater ease in addressing and solving reported crimes, but prevention still lagged behind, despite the deepened connection with the community.<sup>123</sup> Community policing is not entirely ineffectual, but there are some lingering issues that exist in the face of its implementation.

---

<sup>121</sup> Weisburd, David and Charlotte Gill. “Rethinking the Conclusion that Community Policing Does Not Reduce Crime: Experimental Evidence of Crime Reporting Inflation.” *Translational Criminology* (2020): 4. Web.

<sup>122</sup> Ibid., 4-5.

<sup>123</sup> Ibid., 5.

The police, existing within the broader infrastructure and bureaucracy of the state, often find it difficult to reach communities that view themselves as apart from them, functioning as standalone and separate entities. Max Mendez Beck and Rivke Jaffe question the relationship between communities and their cultures, as well as their relationship to the state that is tasked with governing them. One issue that law enforcement faces is that there are multiple types of governance over cultural regions. For example, some models assume “that the state is the main governance actor,” but there can be competing forms of governance that involve organized crime and gangs.<sup>124</sup> Community policing becomes extraordinarily difficult when competing, alternative hierarchies of governance are vying for control over a particular area of a city environment.<sup>124</sup> Many criminal organizations are strategic and tactical, as well, “and may even distribute social welfare to the elderly and employment opportunities to the young,” making the idea of community policing difficult.<sup>124</sup> Community policing is compromised when a culture or subculture already polices itself, apart from local or state law enforcement. For some participants, the likelihood of fortune and security is better secured in the hands of gangs or organized crime, rather than state-based law enforcement that has been characterized as adversarial.

The idea of cooperation, and how best to gain cooperation, is explored in Ellan Giebels article “The Cultural Dimension of Uncertainty Avoidance Impacts Police-Civilian Interaction.” Most law enforcement interactions seek to either “gain cooperation” or to inspire “behavioral change, such as occurs during crisis negotiations

---

<sup>124</sup> Beck, Max Mendez and Rivke Jaffe. “Community Policing Goes South: Policy Mobilities and New Geographies of Criminology Theory.” *Centre for Crime and Justice Studies* 59 (2019): 827. Web.

and crowd riots.”<sup>125</sup> In these instances, the social science of behavioral studies is important for controlling and directing the situation in question. In understanding the behavior of an individual, law enforcement officers can “adopt an approach that avoids misunderstandings and encourages cooperation.”<sup>125</sup> However, one “important challenge to officers’ sense making in these situations is the cultural diversity of the parties encountered.”<sup>125</sup> Cultural differences can often serve as hurdles, or roadblocks, and “can negatively influence mutual understandings and cooperation because the expectations and norms that aid sense making become incompatible and misleading.”<sup>125</sup> In other words, similar to the positive results found in efforts to reinforce and strengthen community policing, cultural studies and awareness can provide a sense of congruency between a culture and the authorities tasked with policing them. However, as is expected, when there is a disconnect, a lack of understanding of the social sciences can create problematic boundaries that inhibit the process of policing. As a result, cooperation can be difficult to achieve, and behaviors can be difficult to modify and push towards pacification and calm.

In addition to the culture of communities that are policed, law enforcement culture is also a point of study within the domain of social science. “Five Years after Ferguson: Reflecting on Police Reform and What’s Ahead,” an article written by Laurie Robinson, argues that police culture itself has changed since Michael Brown, an unarmed black male, was subjected to police violence and killed by a firearm. Robinson argues that “the culture of policing, not unlike many other established institutions, has not

---

<sup>125</sup> Giebels, Ellen, et al. “The Cultural Dimension of Uncertainty Avoidance Impacts Police-Civilian Interaction.” *American Psychological Association* 41.1 (2017): 93. Web.

traditionally been open to change.”<sup>126</sup> There are cultural norms that are perceived as being problematic, including the “traditional police culture” of assuming the “warrior” mentality that has dominated American policing for decades.”<sup>126</sup> As a solution, Robinson stresses that perhaps law enforcement officers can “develop a stronger training culture mentality,” as well, in order to ensure to lower likelihood of violent incidents including the one that resulted in the loss of Michael Brown’s life. Adjusting cultures that have been in place for some time, or have even been strengthened in recent decades, is a difficult task to achieve. However, if social science is to be applied to local law enforcement and police intelligence, perhaps a potential solution is to study, and alter, law enforcement culture itself.

Understanding police culture is quintessential for reforming the fields of policing and police intelligence. Similar to using psychology, sociology, and related social sciences to better understand cultures and subcultures that are being policed, police culture itself is a useful point of study. Monica Bell wrote *Police Reform and the Dismantling of Legal Estrangement* for the Yale University School of Law in 2017, and it explores the use of social psychology in policing. Social psychology also helps readers understand the differences in perspectives between how the public views the police, and how the police view the public, as well as concepts of police legitimacy.<sup>127</sup> Additionally, social psychology provides insight into “what makes people voluntarily obey and help the state” in the form of complying with, and recognizing, the police. Depending on one’s

---

<sup>126</sup> Robinson, Laurie. “Five Years after Ferguson: Reflecting on Police Reform and What’s Ahead.” *The Annals of The American Academy of Political and Social Science* (2020): 2. Web.

<sup>127</sup> Bell, Monica. *Police Reform and the Dismantling of Legal Estrangement*. New Haven, CT: The Yale Law Journal, 2017. 2073. Web.



culture, there may be varying levels of this “consent-based conception of legitimacy.”<sup>128</sup> In combination with using social science within the training and education of police officers, using their own professional culture as a point of study also appears to be beneficial.

Expanding on Bell’s exploration of police culture and perceptions of legitimacy, Roseanna Sommers and Vanessa Bohns examine the psychology of consent and compliance. Also written for the Yale Law Journal, Sommers and Bohns apply social science to policing culture, professionals working within law enforcement and police intelligence, as well as how they are perceived by the public. In order to create a more effective police force, a better understanding of “human psychology” is required, which means that both the public and police forces everywhere can better understand each other.<sup>129</sup> Rather than simply focusing on “a fiction of the crudest sort,” which is that police are rooted in “legal consequence,” it is instead paramount to understand that police officers and the public exist in their own environments which are typically segregated from each other, especially in the discipline of psychology.<sup>129</sup> A stronger chance at achieving compliance, as well as understanding public consent, has a higher likelihood of being achieved for officers and police intelligence employees through social science.

### **State Law Enforcement and Intelligence**

Within select regions where undocumented immigration is a concern, using social science to study police activity is stifled out of fear of repercussions related to immigration authorities. While people within these communities believe there is a sense

---

<sup>128</sup> Bell, Monica. *Police Reform and the Dismantling of Legal Estrangement*. New Haven, CT: The Yale Law Journal, 2017. 2076. Web.

<sup>129</sup> Sommers, Roseanna, and Vanessa Bohns. *The Voluntariness of Voluntary Consent: Consent Searches and the Psychology of Compliance*. New Haven, CT: The Yale Law Journal, 2019. 1962. Web.

of “importance of building trusting relations among stakeholders who are community and culturally knowledgeable,” there is a sense of fear that persists concerning whether or not any knowledge or insight into immigrant cultures can be weaponized and cause harm.<sup>130</sup> Historically speaking, cultural studies has a troubling past when it comes to the use of police forces, and intelligence, to combat immigrant cultures. In their article, “Community Oriented Policing: Security in the Domestic Counter Terrorism Environment,” Goldberg and Christopher explain, the “permanent government agencies employing full time officers to prevent crime was precipitated by the rise in violence and disorder in America in the 1830s. As they developed, police organizations came under the influence of partisan politics which engendered a culture of corruption and favoritism.”<sup>131</sup> After their development, a sense of cultural supremacy was developed within entities used to police immigrant cultures. Some cultures and subcultures were disproportionately targeted, while others were allowed to function unimpeded by law enforcement. For this reason, caution and worry surround the idea of using social sciences such as cultural studies in order to better understand some cultures and subcultures.

Persistent issues exist when studying the culture, and other social aspects, of networks involved in police intelligence. One issue persisting within police intelligence is that the existing culture, according to Ryan Sinclair Cotter in his article “Police intelligence: connecting-the dots in a network society,” is not prepared to adopt newer methods of gathering information. Past policing cultures have worked largely with

---

<sup>130</sup> Goldberg, Kenneth and Kenneth Christopher. “Community Oriented Policing: Security in the Domestic Counter Terrorism Environment.” *Journal of Business and Behavioral Sciences* 31.1 (2019): 117. Web.

<sup>131</sup> Ibid., 115.

gathering “human source information,” which is almost the equivalent of human intelligence, or HUMINT, within police intelligence.<sup>132</sup> However, newer approaches are better equipped to deal with digital networks and information sharing.<sup>132</sup> One unfortunate issue pertaining to these newer methods is that police intelligence becomes difficult when law enforcement officers from earlier generations originate from a culture that “may resist inputting sensitive information into digital information networks,” among other concerns their generation may have.<sup>132</sup> The “‘need-to-know’ mentality” persists within police intelligence culture, which prioritizes secrecy above all else.<sup>132</sup> Similar to other cultural issues related to policing, a cultural study of employees within the police intelligence community reveals that culture can be a factor that inhibits progress and effectiveness.

On the topic of social science and its application to police intelligence, neighboring countries can share valuable perspectives and serve as reference points for law enforcement within the United States. Within Canada, there has been extensive study into the cultures surrounding police units, as well as “how different police units form, function and interact with each other in police organisations.”<sup>133</sup> The author of “The police intelligence division-of-labour,” James Sheptycki, describes this area of study as “a vital aspect of police research.”<sup>133</sup> In recent moments, “community and problem oriented policing prescribes a social crime prevention focus on community intelligence that aims to alter the circumstances productive of crime and disorder.”<sup>134</sup> Within Canada,

---

<sup>132</sup> Cotter, Ryan Sinclair. “Police intelligence: connecting-the-dots in a network society.” *Policing and Society* 27.2 (2017): 174. Web.

<sup>133</sup> Sheptycki, James. “The police intelligence division-of-labour.” *Policing and Society* 27.6 (2017): 620. Web.

<sup>134</sup> Ibid., 625.

a community-oriented approach is used in order to build a better understanding of the communities being policed, their cultural values, and how to work together in order to mitigate the likelihood of crimes. One of the few complaints is that this approach focuses too heavily on “the easy targets rather than the more difficult to get at but more socially harmful activities of other groups.”<sup>134</sup> For instance, it is much easier to target a lower level drug dealer, or another sort of readily identifiable criminal, than it is to dismantle an organized crime group that uses careful procedures and security measures. Similar to related attempts at community policing, some problems are addressed while others remain difficult to control.

Stress studies are a lesser known, but important and contributory, branch of the social sciences. While many targets of study and inquiry focus on police officers in the field, as well as police intelligence employees who directly inform officers in the field, another focus are managers and administrative figures working within law enforcement. In order to enhance the field of law enforcement, and render it more effective and congruent with the public, understanding the psychology of managing a police force is necessary. In the article, “Occupational Stress Profiles of Senior Police Managers: Cross-Cultural Study of Officers From Berlin and Northern Ireland,” Bruce Kirkcaldy explains how the “majority of studies on occupational stress among police employees have focused on front-line uniformed patrol officers,” and these employees report that there are “significant sources of stress” found within “management style, procedures and systems”<sup>135</sup> What is additionally important is investigating the “impact of occupational

---

<sup>134</sup> Sheptycki, James. “The police intelligence division-of-labour.” *Policing and Society* 27.6 (2017): 625. Web.

<sup>135</sup> Kirkcaldy, Bruce, et al. “Occupational Stress Profiles of Senior Police Managers: Cross-Cultural Study of Officers From Berlin and Northern Ireland.” *Stress Medicine* 10 (1994): 127. Web.

stress on senior managers in the police”<sup>135</sup> Due to “staff shortages, inadequate support and communication from their line managers,” as well as “having to deal with police-public conflicts and responding to the media,” senior administrative law enforcement officials report significant amounts of stress.<sup>135</sup> This application of psychology and behavior are additional ways in which social science can provide a clearer understanding of law enforcement and police intelligence.

### **Specialized Federal Law Enforcement and Intelligence**

In the case of the United States Secret Service, the social sciences have been prioritized as a worthwhile career pursuit. In an effort to expand the diversity of their proficiencies, the Secret Service has recognized the value of disciplines related to the domain of social science. In the Secret Service’s article, “Committed to Developing our Greatest Assets,” they describe, among physical fitness and criminal law, “psychology” is a key component of the training process.<sup>136</sup> Georgetown University’s Cawley Career Education Center also reinforces the importance of this field of study, explaining how sociology can aid and support the mission of the United States Secret Service. They cite that many sociology majors find themselves working as “secret service agents.”<sup>137</sup> Education within social sciences, such as “law, public policy, business, government, social work, or psychology,” can actually land an applicant in a career rooted within the Secret Service.<sup>137</sup> Georgetown University describes a “background in sociology” as “valuable preparation for careers in virtually every modern organizational setting.” Interestingly, Georgetown University stresses that it is not only a matter of the social

---

<sup>135</sup> Kirkcaldy, Bruce, et al. “Occupational Stress Profiles of Senior Police Managers: Cross-Cultural Study of Officers From Berlin and Northern Ireland.” *Stress Medicine* 10 (1994): 127. Web.

<sup>136</sup> “Committed to Developing our Greatest Assets.” *United States Secret Service*. N.d. Web. 28 Jun. 2020.

<sup>137</sup> “What Can I Do with My Sociology Major?” *Georgetown University*. N.d. Web. 28 Jun. 2020.

sciences being helpful for law enforcement and police intelligence, but rather for all modern organizational settings. The beneficial nature of the social sciences is not necessarily universal, but is widely applicable. Additionally, Purdue University stresses the importance of learning and utilizing the social sciences in order to better understand “how individual’s behavior choices shape society.”<sup>138</sup> The “practical application of sociological theories to investigate modern-day political, cultural, and social problems” is essential to agents working within the Secret Service.<sup>138</sup> Between the Secret Service itself, as well as institutions who help produce upcoming agents of the future, the usefulness of social science is widely varying and helpful.

Out of the many skills appreciated by the Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives, or the ATF, is the entirety of the social sciences. Whether that means diverse, culturally aware applicants, or professionals rooted in psychology or behavioral studies, among other disciplines, the ATF is committed to utilizing the social sciences. In their article, titled “Diversity and Inclusion: Why Diversity Matters,” they explain their commitment to cultural enrichment, encouraging people from all cultures to apply. They write that the “ATF achieves its mission by capitalizing on the different cultures, backgrounds, experiences, and perspectives” of its applicants.<sup>139</sup> Rather than focusing on any one culture or ethnicity, the ATF uses cultural studies in order to learn, and to use the skills provided by various cultures found throughout the melting pot that is the United States. Moreover, in one of their agent profiles, the ATF highlights “Erica,” an agent who works as a Management and Program Analyst and Event Coordinator in the Office of

---

<sup>138</sup> “What Can I Do With A Degree In Law and Society?” *Purdue University Department of Sociology*. N.d. Web. 28 Jun. 2020.

<sup>139</sup> “Diversity and Inclusion: Why Diversity Matters.” *Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF)*. 17 Apr. 2020. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.

Public and Governmental Affairs.<sup>140</sup> Among other details, it highlights that Erica is a psychology major.<sup>140</sup> Being an analyst of her sort, and tasked with affecting management procedures and the evaluation of programs, her background in psychology is argued to be a natural pairing.<sup>140</sup> Another agent profile, which is similar to Erica's, is featured on the ATF's "ATF Stories" page, is that of Vaughn Smith.<sup>141</sup> He is a "program manager in the Diversity and Career Impact program within ATF's Human Resources and Professional Development Branch."<sup>141</sup> Working within the human resources department of the ATF is an important role, because it manages the interactions and disputes between employees, ranging from togetherness and the sharing of cultures to sensitive disputes. His background pertains to studying the Civil Rights Movement, as well as psychology.<sup>141</sup> This blended approach, rooted in the social science, is valued by the ATF. Additionally, the ATF's own recruiting criteria pertains to the social sciences. They explain it is encouraged that applicants "must have 1 full year of graduate-level study in Criminal Justice, Sociology, Psychology, Political Science."<sup>142</sup> Across universities, the ATF, and its most celebrated agents, the use of social science is used to enrich intelligence employees tied to police, as well as law enforcement officials.

In addition to the progress made by the ATF and Secret Service, the Drug Enforcement Agency, or DEA, is continuing to integrate the social sciences into its practices. Christine Sannerud, who describes herself as the "sole psychologist within a

---

<sup>140</sup> "Erica." *Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF)*. 25 Jun. 2020. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.

<sup>141</sup> "A Family Legacy of Championing Diversity." *Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF)*. 28 Feb. 2020. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.

<sup>142</sup> "Special Agent Information Packet." *U.S. Department of Justice Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives*. N.d. Web. 20 Jun. 2020.

group of a dozen pharmacologists and chemist.”<sup>143</sup> While in comparison to the Secret Service and ATF, these numbers may appear to be insufficiently lower, there is a growing appreciation for social science at the DEA. For instance, psychopharmacology and the psychology behind drug use are integral for learning how to prevent substance abuse, locate and apprehend select abusers, and understand the behavioral choices behind people who engage in this sort of illegal behavior.<sup>143</sup> On a related note, the importance of the social science is also tied to qualifying for positions within the DEA. In order to ensure that their agents are well-equipped to enforce drug laws, psychological assessments are also required.<sup>144</sup> In terms of using social science, in the forms of clinical and cognitive psychology, ensuring that a potential agent is not suffering the effects of unfortunate mental conditions and errors in thinking is key. The DEA is not only respects fields within social science to aid them in the law enforcement and intelligence process, but also puts to use the field of psychological analysis to ensure that their agents are sound in mind and thinking processes.

## **V. Discussion of Findings**

In training and educating government employees within the fields of law enforcement and police intelligence, social science is making an impact by providing insight into people and society’s ways of thinking, as well as cultural and subcultural awareness. Starting with recruitment, social science is being used in order to focus on the hiring of applicants whose area of expertise is grounded in psychology, sociology,

---

<sup>143</sup> Sannerud, Christine. “Federal Drug Science Specialist.” *American Psychological Organization*. 1996. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.

<sup>144</sup> “How to become a Special Agent.” *Drug Enforcement Agency*. N.d. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.



cultural studies, and other related fields.<sup>145</sup> What this practice ensures is that some agents and law enforcement officers enter their respective fields with a knowledge of social science, and how social science may be used to their benefit. Aside from recruitment, training and education within the social sciences is also used in order to ensure that prospective agents and officers have a better understanding of their own psychology, the social psychology of the community they are tasked with policing, and cultural differences between police work and select neighborhoods.<sup>146</sup> Training and education within the social sciences has been used by local law enforcement, and the broader field of law enforcement across the country, as well as specialized law enforcement and police intelligence agencies such as the DEA, ATF, and Secret Service. As a result, government employees can better profile and track potential drug users and abusers, traffickers, and people who seek to do harm by way of counterfeiting money, and using explosives and firearms. In order to better understand one's policing environment, social science is both key and integral.

In addition to the various peoples some governments are tasked with policing and on which they are responsible for collecting intelligence, the study of police culture itself has proven to be worthwhile.<sup>147</sup> For instance, there is a divide between law enforcement officials who are on the front lines, and employees who work as management or administrative officials. Understanding the behavioral science behind these employees provides insight into their mindsets, how they think, and how their culture interacts with

---

<sup>145</sup> "Erica." *Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF)*. 25 Jun. 2020. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.

<sup>146</sup> Giebels, Ellan, et al. "The Cultural Dimension of Uncertainty Avoidance Impacts Police-Civilian Interaction." *American Psychological Association* 41.1 (2017): 93. Web.

<sup>147</sup> Robinson, Laurie. "Five Years after Ferguson: Reflecting on Police Reform and What's Ahead." *The Annals of The American Academy of Political and Social Science* (2020): 2. Web.

those they are policing. Managerial figures report that they experience high levels of stress, as well, citing instances of addressing the public, remaining political, and handling staff issues.<sup>148</sup> Any insight into policing culture, and the culture of government employees hired within police intelligence roles, is another way in which social science provides clarity and understanding.

Across many cultures and their differences, social science is making a positive impact in helping officers and agents better understand citizens. However, there are some gaps and limitations to consider in addition to the praise and adoration assigned to social science's role within law enforcement and police intelligence. One gap is that the study of a culture does not precisely provide an accurate sense of how that culture thinks or feels. For example, while community policing can be established, subcultures exist everywhere, oftentimes from small area to small area within a city environment, and understanding the values and mindsets found within that culture can be difficult. Within some environments, growing up and being raised within a subculture just a few city blocks away can mean that one's understanding of a neighboring subculture is compromised to a degree. An officer or agent may have some insight, but their understanding of social psychology, culture, and behavior of a subculture may stem from a partially, or wholly, blinded standpoint. In order to better understand the people one is tasked with policing, more subcultures need to be added to the profession. Additionally, there are limitations to the use of social science, as well. No matter what, and unfortunately so, no amount of understanding will instill complete trust within police forces. For some people, and some broader communities, a hearty distrust and failure to

---

<sup>148</sup> Kirkcaldy, Bruce, et al. "Occupational Stress Profiles of Senior Police Managers: Cross-Cultural Study of Officers From Berlin and Northern Ireland." *Stress Medicine* 10 (1994): 127. Web.

meet eye-to-eye may persist. This is reinforced by Roseanna Sommers and Vanessa Bohns in their findings for the Yale Law Journal. There is a mindset to compliance, and voluntarily being policed, and it is unfortunately a bond that has been broken for many years. It is perhaps broken beyond repair, but the usefulness of social science provides a sense of promise. Lastly, social science can establish a working bond between different peoples and law enforcement and police intelligence agents, but an added limitation is that disciplines found within social science can only be so useful. David Weisburd and Charlotte Gill discovered that, while robust and healthy relationships can be forged between the public and police forces in order to solve crimes and gather intelligence, preventing crimes still lags behind to a considerable degree.<sup>149</sup> In terms of mitigating crime, social science appears to be ineffectual. Rather, it appears to be more of a means of addressing or solving already existing crimes that have previously transpired.

There are opportunities for improvement that exist regarding the use of social science within the fields of law enforcement and police intelligence. In a simple term, more is required. More social science majors and points of study rooted within the social sciences. This measure would require tremendous funding, which is suitable at a federal level, but difficult to achieve for local and state authorities. By expanding the social sciences, police forces and related intelligence agencies could expand their knowledge and understanding of various, nuanced subcultures, as well as apply the skills found within seemingly unrelated and unhelpful fields to their cause. English majors, history majors, anthropology majors, and others, as well as people well-versed in select

---

<sup>149</sup> Weisburd, David and Charlotte Gill. "Rethinking the Conclusion that Community Policing Does Not Reduce Crime: Experimental Evidence of Crime Reporting Inflation." *Translational Criminology* (2020): 5. Web.

subcultures, could be used in order to make a positive impact. Stereotypes point some people in the direction of police work and police intelligence being rooted in sidearm fire, violent altercations, and arrests, but social science shows that there is an opportunity to expand the focus of law enforcement and police intelligence. Opportunities exist to expand the understanding of police culture, police management culture, countless cultures and subcultures, behavioral studies, stress studies, cultural awareness, community efforts, and more. If there is any remedy that may either lessen the likelihood of crimes, and quicken the rate at which committed crimes are solved, it is to expand social science's role within law enforcement and police intelligence so that it may make an event larger impact.

## **VI. Conclusion**

The application of social science in law enforcement, ranging from specific locations to nationally accepted ideas, as well as specialized law enforcement agencies such as the ATF, DEA, and Secret Service, has made widely varying positive impacts. One such impact is the partial dismantling of stereotypes involving law enforcement and police intelligence, including the idea that their primary focus is apprehending suspects, making arrests, patrolling, and oftentimes being involved in violent altercations with suspected criminals. What the use of social psychology, clinical and cognitive psychology, sociology, and behavioral and cultural studies shows is that law enforcement and police intelligence are professions supported by a comprehensive list of disciplines. Professions tied to local and state law enforcement, as well as police intelligence, can involve college degrees and similar credentials in the humanities, as well, which is not a qualification that is readily paired with the field. However, as many job recruitment

websites will show, including that of the Secret Service and ATF, the humanities and social sciences are not only appreciated and sought after, but integral to field. Behavioral studies can aid in the profiling of suspected criminals, as well as help understand the actions of people who are engaging with the police, whether that means through conversation or violence. Cultural studies and community policing help police forces and intelligence agents better understand the areas they are tasked with policing. These measures include better understanding local dialects and terminologies, as well as cultural values, economic situations, and perspectives that may be different from their own. On the other hand, cultural studies also helps the public better understand the officers and agents who work within law enforcement and police intelligence, including some insight into their own policing subculture and stressors. Sociology provides valuable insight into the broader nature of policing, how it can be improved, the conditions that result in higher or lower likelihoods of criminal behavior, and related points of study. Lastly, psychological disciplines can help law enforcement officers and police intelligence agents avoid biases, psychological complexes, and fallacious ways of thinking, all helping to ensure that employees are of a sound mind, and do not apply incorrect and oftentimes harmful ways of thinking to their critical professions. Furthermore, crimes can be solved in a faster manner due to cultural awareness and community policing. There is a lower likelihood of violence for officers and agents, as well as the public, for these same reasons, as well. Situations are rendered safer, due to better understanding behaviors and misbehaviors, as well as misconceptions and misperceptions surrounding the two. Overall, beginning with recruitment and education, being strengthened through

training, and further reinforced through intensive study, the social sciences are making law enforcement and police intelligence more effective on several fronts.

## **Conclusion**

The number of opportunities for improvement that pertain to the use of social science within the fields of law enforcement and intelligence are difficult to quantify. The potential for future fields of study is always readily anticipated, and openly invited. Additional majors within the field of social science and similar areas of study rooted within the social sciences can enrich the entirety of the domain. Although these measures carry the burden of great expense, which is feasible at the federal level, yet tricky to navigate at the state and local level, the reward is tremendous. Police forces and related intelligence agencies could expand their sense of understanding of widely arrayed, subtly different subcultures, as well as make use of seemingly unrelated and disconnected fields to aid in their overall mission. College majors ranging from English, history, anthropology, and others, can be used to benefit law enforcement entities and intelligence agencies. There are some lingering misconceptions, often involving stereotypes that place law enforcement officers and intelligence officers, in violent confrontations, but social science proves that there are robust opportunities to expand the perceptions surrounding these fields far beyond those crude points. One of the most promising solutions for reducing the rates of violent crimes, and speed up the rate at which committed crimes are expanded, it is to commit to an expansive approach to social science's role within law enforcement, police intelligence, and domestic and foreign intelligence.

Considering the many differences and similarities between cultures, their relationship is both complex and complicated. Social science, however, is able to make a positive impact on their ability to relate by helping law enforcement officers and intelligence agents better understand the citizens their tasked with securing. One

opportunity for research is that the study of different cultures does not entirely provide accurate answers as to how that culture thinks or feels. For instance, community policing is helpful, and subcultures marble the human geography of subjugated areas, oftentimes ranging from a miniscule area of a rural area to a block-by-block basis within a city, so accurately understanding the cultural tenets of every subculture may be problematic. Some subcultures are so close in proximity to others, yet so culturally distanced, that they may experience a compromised level of understanding between themselves. As well as officers and agents can be equipped, their understanding of the social sciences may be limited in some manners, creating a need for additional government employees of additional expertise. The people one is tasked with policing can be difficult to understand, so these gaps in understanding can be patched, at least in part, by expanding the number of experts rooted in studying subcultures. Furthermore, social science is not without its limitations. It appears as if trust is a long ways away, for the most part, because no amount of study or research can create a connected and lasting bond between security officials, law enforcement, and their respective populations. There may always exist a sense of skepticism and distrust between citizens and seemingly outside forces. These ideas are backed by Roseanna Sommers and Vanessa Bohns in their findings for the Yale Law Journal. In order to achieve a sense of compliance, a bond needs to be achieved, but the psychology of the situation is unfavorable for imagining that security and intelligence employees, and the population, are one in the same. David Weisburd and Charlotte Gill revealed that, even though strong relationships can exist between governmental security forces and the population, the solving of some crimes can lag



behind as a result of this distrust. Social science may still have room for improvement in preventing crime, but it shows promise in addressing committed crimes.

Police intelligence and varying tiers of law enforcement involves collecting intelligence from different groups of people. Even within the ranks of law enforcement and police intelligence members, however, there are points of study. For administrative figures, their experiences often different from that of officers who consider themselves to be on the front line of law enforcement. This difference between experiences creates a scenario where even police culture has different subcultures to study. Behavior science is a social science discipline that examines and analyzes such employees, providing insight into their ways of thinking, mindsets, and how their culture handles different conditions. Different insights into policing and intelligence culture can be illuminating for the public and experts who wish to develop a stronger sense of understanding.

Social science makes an impact on the fields of law enforcement and police intelligence by providing a theoretical framework through which to study government employees' ways of thinking, and cultural and subcultural studies. Beginning with recruitment, law enforcement and intelligence actively seeks psychology and sociology majors, as well as other college graduates within fields comprising social science and the humanities. This practice ensures that some agents and officers assume their roles with critical knowledge that can help their respective professions. Outside of understanding others, agents and officers are also familiarized with their own psychology, and the difficulties and challenges that may persist pertaining to one's own mind. These are standard approaches found within local law enforcement, police intelligence, as well as federal agencies such as the DEA, ATF, and Secret Service. Government employees are

able to understand the track potential drug users, traffickers, and people seeking to do harm by using explosives, trafficking firearms, and counterfeiting money. Social science is the key behind making these tasks a little more possible.

In addition to the widespread networking of experts within the field, the training process, and dissemination, an additional positive impact is the level of specificity that can be applied to social science. The FBI, U.S. Marshals, and the Department of Homeland Security, all have their specific focuses, and behavioral and social sciences have been helpful for all of them, in addition to other agencies. Behavioral science, and the social sciences, are not a monolithic entity, or a standalone department functioning by itself. Rather, whether speaking with regards to the military, foreign intelligence, or domestic intelligence and law enforcement, seemingly any agency or department can benefit from the inclusion of social science. There does not appear to be any agency or department that has suffered as a result of integrating social science into its studies, approaches, or procedures. Rather, there only ever appears to be a positive impact made to the agencies and departments in question. Regardless of their specific focus as an entity, the FBI, the Department of Homeland Security, and the U.S. Marshals can all customize social science in order to suit their needs.

Rather than inhibiting state and local law enforcement, the research produced by behavioral science unit employees within federal law enforcement and intelligence have the ability to help, rather than hinder. Behavioral studies research, as well as other findings linked to social science, are disseminated to law enforcement departments all across the country in an effort to aid them. This dissemination is one of the crowning achievements of the FBI, the U.S. Marshals, and other agencies studying the use and

application of social science. They are able to take their highly funded, ruthlessly verified and peer-reviewed research, and enrich state and local police departments. Many state and especially local law enforcement departments lack the funding and the personnel in order to conduct similar research themselves, and this dissemination of research and field reports can be invaluable to those departments that do not have the means themselves. There is not only a net positive impact in applying social science to domestic intelligence and federal law enforcement, but there are tangible results in the form of having a higher likelihood of catching violent criminals and sex offenders, expediting the process of finding said criminals, and aiding in the research process itself. The FBI, among other agencies, is able to have their efforts reciprocated by law enforcement departments, because the law enforcement departments that apply the FBI's techniques and approaches to the field can then, in return, report on what was effective or ineffective. The relationship is an immense one, which requires an extensive series of partnerships, but the amount of research and "real world" findings has created an environment of exponentially expanding facts, figures, data, and information. Much of which, in fact, is sent to domestic intelligence agencies for review, and contributes to the further refining of criminal profiling and practices within the field. This symbiotic relationship is an effective one, creating a positive impact that is tremendously helpful for all tiers of law enforcement.

As a result, departments involved in behavioral science, whether that means working for the FBI, the U.S. Marshals, or another agency, are refined. In order to ensure that their impact is an accurate and effective one, employees within behavioral science units are also subjected to academic levels of scrutiny so that it is ensured that their work

is of a high quality. Working in tandem with actual scientists and academics within social science, the already refined behavioral science unit employees have their work peer-reviewed by some of the foremost experts in the field. The end product is a trustworthy, and reliable, series of findings that are then tested in the field, and then further customized and refined over time.

The results of studying whether or not the FBI's use of social science within the discipline of law enforcement, and domestic intelligence, has made a positive impact is clear. It is clear in the sense that the use of behavioral science, psychology, cultural studies, and related fields of study have aided all tiers of law enforcement in a variety of manners. Whether it means establishing criminal profiles, so that law enforcement can compartmentalize and expedite their searches for violent offenders, or providing tools for law enforcement to conduct more effective interviews with criminals, there is a wide array of benefits to be found. Beginning with the training process itself, and the ability to even become a member of the behavioral science unit, the use of social science within domestic intelligence and federal law enforcement has become highly refined in comparison to its inception in the mid twentieth century. After what is a competitive and difficult application process, successful applicants must then receive extensive training over the duration of months. As a result, the current behavioral science unit is college-educated, trained in a generalized sense, and then the recipient of further, more specialized, training in order to even join the behavioral science unit as a novice.

Including the social sciences in the intelligence process, whether that means military or civil intelligence, increases the likelihood of mission success. Its absence, as is noted in Vietnam and the earlier years of the War in Iraq, has contributed to social and cultural

friction, as well as a heightened probability of protest and anger among foreign citizens. On the other hand, its inclusion, especially in Afghanistan and other states within Africa and Central Asia, has enabled and empowered strategic operations. The impact made by social science on the intelligence process, and its implementation abroad, is a positive one. For that reason, academics and experts continue to expand the field of study. Since it produces a net positive impact on the broader field of intelligence, it will continue to grow and expand both in terms of its application in operations and as a point of study for academics.

Moving forward, conflict resolution will foreseeably be aided by social science. Since there is a value to be found in the social sciences and their application to intelligence, both experts and scholars alike have expanded the research materials pertaining to its usage in warzones. Turning toward the future, it is important to consider how the military and civilian intelligence communities will adjust and adhere to social science, now that it is proven to be effectual in warzones. Determining how best to move forward, given the established usefulness of social science in intelligence, is important, and may have positive effects that extend to commanders, intelligence officials, and citizens of foreign countries. Considering the work with which social scientists are involved, the nature of how both military and civilian organizations are run, and the overall culture created and fostered within the broader intelligence community, social science may make a positive impact that is difficult to quantify.

The findings in the case studies pertaining to Africa, Afghanistan, and Iraq all appear to support the aforementioned literature surveyed. The present literature on the use of the social sciences in military and intelligence settings advocates for and supports

its usefulness. After examining the outcomes in three environments pertaining to the War on Terror, the prevailing conclusion is that, while social science and Human Terrain Teams are not perfect, they are effective. There are criticisms to be found, but the overall impact of the discipline on the military and civil intelligence is positive. Overall, there are many more benefits than detriments, and operations are rendered more effective as a result.

Examples found within cultural studies illuminate how social science can be a tool with which to improve police intelligence and law enforcement efforts. Outside cultures not only relocate to the United States, but the culture whose people emigrate to the United States, and the cities they end up in matter. There are Cuban Americans in New York City, Puerto Rican Americans in New York City, and many others. However, from New York City to Philadelphia, and from Los Angeles to Miami, their stories differ. Cuban Americans situated in Miami likely have a different story to tell, and a different subculture to share than Cuban Americans in Chicago. For these reasons, community policing, and cultural awareness are key. Rather than being seen as oppressors or outsiders, in an adversarial sense, police intelligence members and law enforcement can instead be seen as one of their own whose goal is simply to keep the peace and ensure the security of the community. This outcome is one of many ways in which the social science of cultural studies, among other specializations aids all levels of law enforcement and intelligence operated on behalf of the United States.

## Bibliography

- “Acting Director of the U.S. Marshals Service: Who is David Harlow?” *AllGov*. 20 Feb. 2017. Web. 15 Oct. 2019.
- “A Family Legacy of Championing Diversity.” *Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF)*. 28 Feb. 2020. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.
- Ahram, Ariel. “Iraq in the Social Sciences: Testing the Limits of Research.” *Journal of the Middle East and Africa* 4.3 (2013): 251-266. Web.
- Albro, Robert. “Anthropology and the Military: AFRICOM, 'culture' and future of Human Terrain Analysis.” *Anthropology Today* 26. 1 (2010): 22-24. Web.
- Bachmann, Jan. “Kick Down the Door, Clean up the Mess, and Rebuild the House' – The Africa Command and Transformation of the US Military.” *Geopolitics* 15 (2010): 564-585. Web.
- Backzo, Adam. “Legal Rule and Tribal Politics: The US Army and the Taliban in Afghanistan (2001-2013).” *Development and Change* 47, no 6 (2016): 1412-1433.
- Beck, Max Mendez and Rivke Jaffe. “Community Policing Goes South: Policy Mobilities and New Geographies of Criminology Theory.” *Centre for Crime and Justice Studies* 59 (2019): 823-841. Web.
- Bell, Monica. *Police Reform and the Dismantling of Legal Estrangement*. New Haven, CT: The Yale Law Journal, 2017. Web.
- Bojor, Laviniu. “Human Terrain Team – Premise for Civil-Military Cooperation in Irregular Conflicts.” *Military Art and Science* 3, no. 71 (2013): 227-230.
- Bonds, Eric. “Terrorizing Violence and the Iraq War: Civilian Victimization, Humanitarian Norms, and Social Science.” *Humanity & Society* 38.4 (2014): 365-

387. Web.
- Bonn, Scott A. "Criminal Profiling: The Original Mind Hunters." *Psychology Today*. 4 Dec. 2017. Web. 6 Nov. 2019.
- Bonn, Scott A. "Origin of the Term 'Serial Killer.'" *Psychology Today*. 9 Jun. 2014. Web. 6 Nov. 2019.
- Buozis, Michael. "'Bizarre Dissonances in Baltimore': Class and Race in the Color-blind Discourses of Police Violence." *Democratic Communiqué* 27 (2018): 41. Web.
- Collins, Riley. "At the Edges of the Map: The Chronotope of Informatics and Maps of Human Terrain." *Journal of Military & Strategic Studies* 17, no. 1 (2016): 34-60.
- "Committed to Developing our Greatest Assets." *United States Secret Service*. N.d. Web. 28 Jun. 2020.
- Committee on Behavioral and Social Science Research to Improve Intelligence Analysis for National Security. *Intelligence Analysis for Tomorrow: Advances from the Behavioral and Social Sciences*. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press, 2011.
- Connable, Ben. "Human Terrain System is Dead, Long Live ... What? Building and Sustaining Military Cultural Competence in the Aftermath of the Human Terrain System." *Military Review* 91, no. 1 (2018): 24-33.
- Cotter, Ryan Sinclair. "Police intelligence: connecting-the dots in a network society." *Policing and Society* 27.2 (2017): 173-187. Web.
- Cunningham, David. "The Patterning of Repression: FBI Counterintelligence and the New Left." *Social Forces* 82.1 (2003): 209-240. Web.
- Cunningham, David, and Barb Browning. "The Emergence of Worthy Targets: Official



- Frames and Deviance Narratives within the FBI.” *Sociological Forum* 19.3 (2004): 347-369. Web.
- DeNevi, Don. “Into the Minds of Madmen: How the FBI’s Behavioral Science Unit Revolutionized Crime Investigation.” Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 2004. Web.
- “Diversity and Inclusion: Why Diversity Matters.” *Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF)*. 17 Apr. 2020. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.
- Dostri, Omer. “The Role of Human Terrain and Cultural Intelligence in Contemporary Hybrid and Urban Warfare.” *The International Journal of Intelligence Security, and Public Affairs* 21, no. 1 (2019): 84-102.
- Douglas, John. “The Keynote Speaker for the American College of Forensic Examiners 4<sup>th</sup> Annual Scientific Meeting Will Be John Douglas, Retired Head of the FBI Behavioral Science Unit.” *Forensic Examiner* 5.3/4 (1996): 12. Web.
- “Erica.” *Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF)*. 25 Jun. 2020. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.
- “FBI Training Division At-A-Glance.” *Forensic Examiner* 19.3 (2010): 16-17. Web.
- Fitzgerald, James. “The FBI’s Communicated Threat Assessment Database.” *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin* 78.2 (2007): 6-9. Web.
- Follman, Mark. “Trigger Warnings.” *Mother Jones* 40.6 (2015): 22. Web.
- Fox, Bryanna. “What Have We Learned from Offender Profiling? A Systemic Review and Meta-Analysis of 40 Years of Research.” *Psychological Bulletin* 144.12 (2018): 1247-1274. Web.
- Giebels, Ellan, et al. “The Cultural Dimension of Uncertainty Avoidance Impacts Police-

- Civilian Interaction.” *American Psychological Association* 41.1 (2017): 93-102. Web.
- Goldberg, Kenneth and Kenneth Christopher. “Community Oriented Policing: Security in the Domestic Counter Terrorism Environment.” *Journal of Business and Behavioral Sciences* 31.1 (2019): 114-124. Web.
- Gonzalez, Roberto. “On 'tribes' and bribes: 'Iraq tribal study,' al-Anbar's awakening, and social science.” *Focaal* 53 (2009): 105-106. Web.
- Halpern, Mollie and Mark A. Hilts. “Behavioral Analysts.” *Federal Bureau of Investigation*. 2 May 2011. Web. 12 Oct. 2019.
- Hans, Simran. “Killer Instinct.” *Sight & Sound* 27.11 (2017): 36-39. Web.
- Heuer, Richards. *Psychology of Intelligence Analysis*. Washington, DC: Central Intelligence Agency Center for the Study of Intelligence, 1999.
- Hopkins, Benjamin. “The long durée of the Human Terrain: Politics, cultural knowledge and the technical fix.” *Anthropology Today* 32, no. 3 (2016): 8-12.
- “How to become a Special Agent.” *Drug Enforcement Agency*. N.d. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.
- Iran's Ministry of Intelligence and Security: A Profile*. Washington, DC: Library of Congress Federal Research Division, 2012.
- Joseph, Paul. “‘Soft’ Counterinsurgency: Human Terrain Teams and US Military Strategy in Iraq and Afghanistan.” Ed. Michael C. Davies. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014. 136-138. Web.
- Johnston, Rob. *Analytic Culture in the U.S. Intelligence Community: An Ethnographic Study*. Washington, DC: Central Intelligence Agency Center for the Study of Intelligence, 2005.

- King, Anthony. "Social Science Goes to War: The Human Terrain System in Iran and Afghanistan." Eds. Montgomery McFate and Janice Laurence. *International Affairs* 92, no. 6 (2016): 1525-1526.
- Kirkcaldy, Bruce, et al. "Occupational Stress Profiles of Senior Police Managers: Cross-Cultural Study of Officers From Berlin and Northern Ireland." *Stress Medicine* 10 (1994): 127. Web.
- Krause, Meredith. "History and Evolution of the FBI's Undercover Safeguard Program." *Consulting Psychology Journal: Practice and Research* 61.1 (2009): 5-13. Web.
- Lamb, Christopher, et al. "The Way Ahead for Human Terrain Teams." *National Defense University* 70, no. 3 (2013): 21-29.
- Lyall, Jason. "Explaining Support for Combatants during Wartime: A Survey Experiment in Afghanistan." *American Political Science Review* 107, no. 4 (2013): 679-705.
- Medina, Richard. "From Anthropology to Human Geography: Human Terrain and the Evolution of Operational Sociocultural Understanding." *Intelligence and National Security* 31, no. 2 (2016): 137-153.
- "Meet the FBI's Behavioral Science Unit." *Forensic Examiner* 19.3 (2010): 12-15. Web.
- Meijer, Ewout, et al. "Deception Detection with Behavioral, Autonomic, and Neural Measures: Conceptual and Methodological Considerations That Warrant Modesty." *Psychophysiology* 53.5 (2016): 593-604. Web.
- Moulton, Erica. "Crafting an 'Authentic' Monster: Dialogue, Genre and Ethical Questions in *Mindhunter*." *Journal of Screenwriting* 10.2 (2017): 195-212. Web.
- Nadal, Kevin, et al. "Emotional, Behavioral, and Cognitive Reactions to Microaggressions: Transgender Perspectives." *Psychology of Sexual Orientation*

- and Gender Diversity* 1.1 (2014): 72-81. Web.
- O'Toole, Mary Ellen. "Becoming an FBI Profiler." *Mary Ellen O'Toole*. 13 Oct. 2011. Web. 5 Nov. 2019.
- Price, Brian. "Human Terrain at the Crossroads." *JFQ* 87.4 (2017): 69-75. Web.
- "Qualifications." *U.S. Marshals Service*. N.d. Web. 15 Oct. 2019.
- "Radical Research: Understanding Origins of Terrorism." *Department of Homeland Security*. 6 Jul. 2009. Web. 12 Oct. 2019.
- Robbennolt, Jennifer. "Behavioral Legal Ethics." *Arizona State Law Journal* 45.3 (2013): 1107-1182. Web.
- Robinson, Laurie. "Five Years after Ferguson: Reflecting on Police Reform and What's Ahead." *The Annals of The American Academy of Political and Social Science* (2020): 2. Web.
- Sannerud, Christine. "Federal Drug Science Specialist." *American Psychological Organization*. 1996. Web. 15 Jun. 2020.
- "School Shooters Can Be Stopped: A Valuable New Resource." *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin* (2019): 22-24. Web.
- "Science & Technology Directorate Human Factors/Behavioral Sciences Division." *Department of Homeland Security*. 31 Jan. 2011. Web. 15 Oct. 2019.
- Sheptycki, James. "The police intelligence division-of-labour." *Policing and Society* 27.6 (2017): 620-635. Web.
- Sommers, Roseanna, and Vanessa Bohns. *The Voluntariness of Voluntary Consent: Consent Searches and the Psychology of Compliance*. New Haven, CT: The Yale Law Journal, 2019. Web.

- “Special Agent Information Packet.” *U.S. Department of Justice Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives*. N.d. Web. 20 Jun. 2020.
- Spencer, Emily. “Enabling Local Solutions to Global Problems: The Role of Cultural Intelligence in Building Global SOF Networks.” *Journal of Strategic Security* 7, no. 2 (2014): 29-36.
- Straus, Susan, et al. “The Group Matters: A Review of the Processes and Outcomes in Intelligence Analysis.” *American Psychological Association* 15, no. 2 (2011): 128-146.
- “The FBI Behavioral Science Unit's Evil Minds Research Museum.” *Forensic Examiner* 19.3 (2010): 18-19. Web.
- “The Homegrown Threat: Booklet Lists Observable Indicators of Potential Violent Extremists.” *Federal Bureau of Investigation*. 16 Jul. 2019. Web. 12 Oct. 2019.
- Tierney, Michael. “Using Behavioral Analysis to Prevent Violent Extremism: Assessing the Cases of Michael Zehaf-Bibeau and Aaron Driver.” *Journal of Threat Assessment and Management* 4.2 (2017): 98-110. Web.
- Tomes, Robert. “Toward a Smarter Military: Socio-Cultural Intelligence and National Security.” *Parameters* 42, no. 2 (2015): 61-76.
- Tromblay, Darren. “Fixing a Failure to Identify Intelligence in the Domestic Setting: Aligning Collection and Analysis to Address an All-Hazards Mission.” *Homeland Security & Emergency Management* 12.2 (2015): 241-255. Web.
- Vecchi, Gregory. “The FBI Behavioral Science Unit's Approach to World-Class Training.” *The Forensic Examiner* 19.3 (2010): 74-80. Web.
- Vecchi, Gregory and Steven Conlon. “The FBI Behavioral Science Unit's Evil Minds

- Research Museum.” *The Forensic Examiner* 19.3 (2010): 18-19. Web.
- Wainwright, Joel. “The US Military and Human Geography: Reflections on Our Conjecture.” *Annals of the American Association of Geographers* 106, no. 3 (2016): 513-520.
- Walsh, Patrick. “Making future leaders in the US intelligence community: challenges and opportunities.” *Intelligence and National Security* 32, no. 4 (2017): 441-459.
- Walter, Ben. “Interpreting the 'Human Terrain' of Afghanistan with Enlightenment Philosophy.” *International Studies Perspectives* (2016): 409-424. Web.
- Weisburd, David and Charlotte Gill. “Rethinking the Conclusion that Community Policing Does Not Reduce Crime: Experimental Evidence of Crime Reporting Inflation.” *Translational Criminology* (2020): 4-6. Web.
- “What Can I Do With A Degree In Law and Society?” *Purdue University Department of Sociology*. N.d. Web. 28 Jun. 2020.
- “What Can I Do with My Sociology Major?” *Georgetown University*. N.d. Web. 28 Jun. 2020.
- Zamri, Zahid. “Social Science Goes to War: The Human Terrain System in Iraq and Afghanistan.” *Intellectual Discourse* 25, no. 1 (2017): 282-285.

## **Vita**

### **EDUCATION**

#### Johns Hopkins University

- Master of Arts in Government
- Security Studies Concentration
- 2020
- Graduate Certificate in Science, Technology, and International Security
- 2018
- Graduate Certificate in Intelligence
- 2017

#### Union Institute & University

- Doctor of Philosophy in Interdisciplinary Studies
- Major in Humanities & Culture
- 2016
- Graduate Certificate in Identity Studies
- 2014
- Online Instruction Course
- 2012

State University of New York at Cortland

- Master of Arts in English
- Emphases on Critical Analysis and Teaching
- 2011
  
- Bachelor of Arts in English
- 2010

Broome Community College (BCC)

- Associate of Arts in Liberal Arts
- 2007

**TEACHING EXPERIENCE**

Tompkins Cortland Community College (TC3)

- Adjunct Associate Professor of English | Fall 2011 to Present
  
- ENGL 102: Approaches to Literature | Fall 2017
- Online Sections of ENGL 100 and 101 | Fall 2012 to Present
- Hybrid Sections of ENGL 100 and 101 | Fall 2013 to Spring 2017
- ENGL 201: Fundamentals of Speech | Spring 2015
- Themed section of Academic Writing II | Gender and Critical Analysis | Fall 2013
- “Late Start” Section of Academic Writing I | Spring 2013, 2014, 2016, and 2017
- ENGL 100: Academic Writing I | Fall 2012 to Spring 2015
- ENGL 101: Academic Writing II | Fall 2012 to Spring 2015



#### Southern Utah University

- Online Adjunct Instructor of English | Summer 2019 to Present
- ENGL 2010: Intermediate Thematic Writing I | Summer 2019 to Spring 2020
- ENGL 1010: Introduction to Academic Writing | Fall 2019 to Spring 2020

#### West Coast University

- Online English Instructor I | Summer 2018 to Present
- ENGL 240: Written Communication II | Fall 2018
- ENGL 140: Written Communication I | Fall 2018

#### Bryant & Stratton College

- Online Adjunct Instructor of English and Communication | Fall 2016 to Present
- ENGL 320: World Literature | Fall 2018
- ENGL 302: Advanced Research and Writing | Fall 2019
- ENGL 250: Research and Writing II | Spring 2020
- ENGL 202: Intermediate Research and Writing | Summer 2018 to Fall 2018
- ENGL 102: Research and Writing for the Workplace | Summer 2017 to Summer 2018
- ENGL 101: Research and Writing I | Spring 2017
- COMM 201: Public Speaking | Spring 2017

- COMM 115: Introduction to Information Literacy | Fall 2016 to Spring 2017
- COMM 104: Learning Communities | Spring 2018 to Fall 2018

#### Broome Community College (BCC)

- Adjunct Instructor of English | Fall 2013 to Fall 2017
- Hybrid Sections of ENG 110 and 111: College Writing I and II | Spring 2013 to Fall 2017
- ENG 110: College Writing I | Spring 2014 to Fall 2017
- ENG 111: College Writing II | Fall 2013 to Fall 2015

#### Corning Community College (CCC)

- Visiting Instructor of English | Fall 2013 to Fall 2015
- Online Sections of ENGL 1010 and 1020 | Spring and Fall 2015
- ENGL 1010: College Composition I | Fall 2013 to Fall 2015
- ENGL 1020: College Composition II | Spring 2014 to Spring 2015

### **SUPPLEMENTAL INSTRUCTION (SI)**

#### State University of New York at Cortland

- Basic Composition and Remedial English | Spring 2009 to Spring 2010

#### Broome Community College (BCC)

- Basic Composition, Remedial English, and Note-Taking | Spring 2007 to Fall

2007

### **ADDITIONAL EXPERIENCE**

#### West Coast University

- Curriculum and Instructional Designer | Summer 2019
- Course Writer for ENGL 250: Technical Writing | Summer 2019

#### The Princeton Review

- English, Writing, and College-Level Essay Tutor | Summer 2017 to Spring 2018

#### *Penumbra: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Critical and Creative Inquiry* Academic Journal

- Editor and Proofreader | Summer 2012 to Summer 2016

#### Corning Community College (CCC)

- Faculty Leader and Sponsor for Student Writing Group | Spring 2014 to Fall 2015
- Proofreader for *SCOP Student Magazine* | Spring 2014 to Fall 2015

#### TC3 Adjunct Association

- Sergeant at Arms | Summer 2015
- Junior Member of the Executive Council | Fall 2014 to Summer 2015

#### Southern Cayuga Publishing (SCP)

- Co-Founder | Spring 2014

- Specializes in printing open source, low-cost textbooks.

#### Educational Testing Service (ETS)

- Constructed Response Scoring Professional (Test Rater) | Spring 2013 to Spring 2014

#### Tompkins Cortland Community College (TC3)

- Proofreader for *Re-Vision* | Spring 2013
- Writers' Guild Member | Spring 2013

#### *Bedlam & Repose* Literary Magazine

- Editor and Proofreader | Fall 2011 to Fall 2012

#### *Student Observation & Research (SOAR)* Academic Journal

- Editor and Proofreader | Fall 2011 to Fall 2012

#### State University of New York at Cortland

- Writing Fellow | Spring 2010 to Fall 2011
- Editor and Proofreader for *Transition* literary magazine | Spring 2009 to Fall 2011

### **TRAINING**

#### Advanced Technical Intelligence Center (ATIC)

- Student | Summer 2015 to Fall 2016

## PUBLICATIONS

### Conferences

- University of Cincinnati conference on “Insurrection, Subversion, and Rebellion.”  
Placed on Panel 4: Politics of Gender and Race Discourses. Presented the essay  
“Reframing Gender as Creative.” | Spring 2015
- Residency conference on “Human Suffering and Social Change: Justice,  
Creativity, and Action.” Organized by Union Institute & University and hosted at  
the University of Cincinnati Conference Center. | Spring 2013

### Publishing and Editing

- Formatted, edited, and published textbook: Barrett, John. *Rhetoric and  
Composition: A Student Guide to Foundational Writing*. Ithaca, New York:  
Southern Cayuga Publishing, 2014. | Print

### Texts

- *Open Source Identity: Countering the Binary Through Self-Definition and  
Creativity*. Dissertation, Union Institute & University. Cincinnati, Ohio. 2016. |  
Web
- “Reframing Gender as Creative.” *Penumbra: An Interdisciplinary Journal of  
Critical and Creative Inquiry*. Ohio: Union Institute & University, 2015. | Print  
and Web
- *Along the Verge: The Issue of Essentialism Versus Constructionism Within the  
Domain of Contemporary Masculinity Studies*. Thesis, SUNY Cortland. 2013. |

## Print

- *From Within the Borderland*. New York: SOAR, 2012. | Print and Web
- *SOAR Student Journal*, Spring 2012 Edition. | Web
- *SOAR Student Journal*, 2011-2012 Winter Supplement. | Web
- *SOAR Student Journal*, Fall 2011 Edition. | Web

## Poetry

- “That Ancient and Wicked Evil.” *Bedlam & Repose*. 2014. | Web
- “Nuclear Thread.” *Bedlam & Repose*. 2012. | Web
- “From the Top Railing.” *Transition Literary Magazine*. New York: SUNY Cortland, 2011. | Print
- “Letters from Home.” *Transition Literary Magazine*. New York: SUNY Cortland, 2011. | Print
- “Temporary Stains.” *Transition Literary Magazine*. New York: SUNY Cortland, 2011. | Print
- “Subtle Tones.” *Transition Literary Magazine*. New York: SUNY Cortland, 2010. | Print

## RESEARCH INTERESTS

- Postmodernism | Postcolonialism | Argumentative Analysis | Identity Studies | Creativity Studies | Interdisciplinarity | Contemporary American Fiction | Essentialism | Social Relativism | Cognitive Psychology | Anti-theory | Social Constructionism | Instructional Constructivism

## **MEMBERSHIPS & AWARDS**

- The Princeton Club of New York | 2017
- National Military Intelligence Association | 2015
- The Academy of American Poets | 2013
- The Association of Writers & Writing Programs via George Mason University | 2013
- Modern Language Association | 2012
- Graduated *cum laude* from Cortland University | 2010
- Cortland Writers Association | 2009 to 2011
- Sigma Tau Delta, the International English Honor Society | 2009
- Tau Sigma, the National Honor Society for Transfer Students | 2009

## **RELATED SKILLS**

### Online

- WebCT | Blackboard | CampusWeb | Angel | Ning | Wiki | Email | PowerCampus | Canvas

### Offline

- Microsoft Office | OpenOffice | WordPerfect Office
- MLA, APA, and Chicago Citation and Formatting Styles